

# Notes

## Introduction

1. Huntington's hypothesis was first articulated in a 1993 *Foreign Affairs* article entitled "The Clash of Civilizations?" The hypothesis was expounded at book length in 1997. Samuel P. Huntington, "The Clash of Civilizations?" *Foreign Affairs* 72 (Summer 1993): 22–28; and Samuel P. Huntington, *The Clash of Civilizations and the Remaking of World Order* (New York: Touchstone, 1997). See Stanley Kurtz, "The Future of History," *Policy Review* 113 (June/July 2002).
2. Samuel Huntington, Keynote Address, Colorado College's 125th Anniversary Symposium: "Cultures in the 21st Century: Conflicts and Convergences," February 4, 1999.
3. Caution is taken when using the terms "West" and "Islam," or "Western civilization" and "Islamic civilization." This project is sensitive to the tendencies to objectify "Western" or "Islamic" identity with oversimplified generalizations and stereotypes that suppose a neat, compartmentalized unity of culture—neglecting the intracultural differences and internal struggles between religious and secular, as well as local, state, and regional entities. Recognizing the historical interconnectedness of our world and the internal complexity and diversity of civilizations, the above terms are used within a cross-cultural paradigm that seeks to accentuate the important differences, as well as shared values, between Western and Islamic cultures.
4. The divisive terms *dar al-kufr* (or *dar al-harb*: "abode of war") and *dar al-Islam* are regularly utilized by Muslim extremists. Concomitantly, many westerners also nurture a binary perspective that contrasts a "peace-loving," "civilized" West with a "backwards," "belligerent" Muslim world.

Muslim intellectual Khaled Abou El Fadl describes how this dichotomous view of the world—*dar al-harb* versus *dar al-Islam*—was derived by Muslim jurists writing during a developmental era for Islamic law, from the eighth to eleventh centuries. This medieval period was characterized by incessant reciprocating threats and forays between rival states and kingdoms, where territorial dominance was a geopolitical necessity. Abou El Fadl rightly references historical context—not religious conviction—as the prevailing impetus behind the incorporation of these divisive geographical distinctions into Islamic jurisprudence. (Neither the Qur'an nor Sunna, the two most important sources of Islamic law, legitimates these distinctions.) Khaled Abou El

- Fadl, *The Great Theft: Wrestling Islam from the Extremists* (New York: HarperCollins, 2005), 223–28. Arguably, in today’s global context of proliferating transnational migration and growing cultural pluralism, a two- or even three-abode world is untenable, even though it is still embraced by pundits and citizens in both Western and Islamic cultures. Despite the geographic and demographic realities that complicate this binary perspective, one must nonetheless address the intellectual and sociocultural arguments that continue to bolster this dichotomous worldview.
5. Fred Dallmayr, “Beyond Monologue: For a Comparative Political Theory,” *Perspectives on Politics* 2 (June 2004): 250.
  6. Dallmayr, 252; see also, Anthony J. Parel, “The Comparative Study of Political Philosophy,” in *Comparative Political Philosophy: Studies Under the Upas Tree*, 2nd ed., ed. Anthony J. Parel and Ronald C. Keith (Lanham, MD: Lexington Books, 2003), 14.
  7. Parel, 12; and Dallmayr, 252.
  8. See Stanley Kurtz’s, “The Future of History,” for a concise and contemplative exposition of the two predominant Western worldviews competing for global allegiance: Samuel Huntington’s “Clash of Civilizations” and Francis Fukuyama’s “The End of History and the Last Man.”
  9. Michael Walzer, *On Toleration* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1997), 2.
  10. Sheikh Ahmad Muhammad Amin Kufaro, lecture given at the Muslim Christian Conference (Malta 1987), available at [http://www.kufaro.org/English/wot/coexistence\\_in\\_mediterranean.htm](http://www.kufaro.org/English/wot/coexistence_in_mediterranean.htm) (accessed on October 10, 2005).
  11. Bernard Lewis, *Islam and the West* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1993), 174.
  12. *Ibid.*, 179.
  13. More information on the purposes of The Alan B. Slifka Program in Intercommunal Coexistence and Coexistence International is available at <http://www.brandeis.edu/programs/Slifka/> and <http://www.brandeis.edu/coexistence/linked%20documents/CIVisionValuesGoals/>. Coexistence International (CI) is an insightful entity dedicated to the idea and processes of coexistence. Its vision statement imagines “a world in which people of different religions, races, ethnicities, and cultures relate with respect and recognize their interdependence, where diversity is embraced for its positive potential, and where equality is valued and actively pursued.” More information on the vision and work of CI is available at <http://www.brandeis.edu/coexistence/about.html>.
  14. “Exploring the Possibilities and Limits of Collaboration: Commonalities and Differences in Coexistence and Related Fields,” prepared for Coexistence International by Isabella Jean, with Jessica Berns and Cynthia Cohen (May 2006), 7, available at <http://www.brandeis.edu/coexistence/linked%20documents/BarometerReport%20FINAL%20June%202006.pdf>. For further reading on coexistence see also Eugene Weiner, ed., *The Handbook of Interethnic Coexistence* (New York: The Abraham Fund, 2000); Muhammad Abu Nimer, *Reconciliation, Justice, and Coexistence: Theory and Practice* (New York:

- Lexington Books, 2001); Antonia Chayes and Martha L. Minow, eds. *Imagine Coexistence: Restoring Humanity After Violent Ethnic Conflict* (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 2003); Yaacov Bar-Siman-Tov, ed., *From Conflict Resolution to Reconciliation* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003); and Morton Deutsch, Peter T. Coleman, and Eric C. Marcs, eds. *The Handbook of Conflict Resolution: Theory and Practice* (San Francisco: John Wiley & Sons, 2006).
15. Jean, Berns, and Cohen, 7. Indeed, positive structural and perceptual transformations often result from nonviolent expressions of conflict. See Angela Nyawira Khaminwa, "Coexistence," in *Beyond Intractability*, ed. Guy Burgess and Heidi Burgess, Conflict Research Consortium, University of Colorado, Boulder. Posted July 2003, available at <http://www.beyondintractability.org/essay/coexistence/>.
  16. Walzer, 2 and xi–xii.
  17. John Christian Laursen, "Orientation: Clarifying the Conceptual Issues," in *Religious Toleration: "The Variety of Rites" from Cyrus to Defoe*, ed. John Christian Laursen (New York: St. Martin's, 1999), 2.
  18. *Ibid.* For a greater examination of the differences between *tolerance* and *toleration* see Andrew R. Murphy, "Tolerance, Toleration, and the Liberal Tradition," *Polity* 29, no. 4 (1997): 593–623; Michael Walzer, xi; Jay Newman, *Foundations of Religious Tolerance* (Toronto: Toronto University Press, 1982); and Phillips Brooks, *Tolerance: Two Lectures* (New York: E. P. Dutton & Company, 1887).
  19. J. Budziszewski, *True Tolerance: Liberalism and the Necessity of Judgment* (New Brunswick, NJ: Transaction Publishers, 2000), 221.
  20. See Cary J. Nederman and John Christian Laursen, eds., *Difference and Dissent: Theories of Toleration in Medieval and Early Modern Europe* (Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield, 1996); John Christian Laursen and Cary J. Nederman, eds., *Beyond the Persecuting Society: Religious Toleration before the Enlightenment* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1998); and John Christian Laursen, *Religious Toleration: "The Variety of Rites from Cyrus to Defoe"*.
  21. Nederman and Laursen, *Difference and Dissent*, 5.
  22. Istvan Bejczy. "Tolerantia: A Medieval Concept," *Journal of the History of Ideas* 58, no. 3 (1997): 367.
  23. *Ibid.*, 372.
  24. Walzer, 10–12. See also, Laursen, "Orientation: Clarifying the Conceptual Issues," 2–3.
  25. Walzer, xii.
  26. See, for example, Mehdi Amin Razavi and David Ambuel, eds., *Philosophy, Religion, and the Question of Intolerance* (New York: State University of New York Press, 1997); Susan Mendus, ed., *The Politics of Toleration in Modern Life* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2000); Louis J. Hammann and Harry M. Buck, eds., *Religious Traditions and the Limits of Tolerance* (Chambersburg, PA: Anima Publications, 1988); and John Christian Laursen, ed., *Religious Toleration: "The Variety of Rites" from Cyrus to Defoe*.

27. Cary J. Nederman, *Worlds of Difference: European Discourses of Toleration, c. 1100-c. 1550* (University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2000).
28. J. Budziszewski, *True Tolerance: Liberalism and the Necessity of Judgment* (New Brunswick, NJ: Transaction Publishers, 2000).
29. Khaled Abou El Fadl, "The Place of Tolerance in Islam," in *The Place of Tolerance in Islam*, ed. Joshua Cohen and Ian Lague (Boston: Beacon, 2002). Yohanan Friedmann, *Tolerance and Coercion in Islam: Interfaith Relations in the Muslim Tradition* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003).

## Chapter 1

1. Samuel Huntington, "If Not Civilizations, What?: Paradigms of the Post-Cold War," *Foreign Affairs* 72 (November/December 1993): 194.
2. Samuel Huntington, Keynote Address, Colorado College's 125th Anniversary Symposium: "Cultures in the 21st Century: Conflicts and Convergences," February 4, 1999, available at <http://www.coloradocollege.edu/Academics/Anniversary/Transcripts/HuntingtonTXT.htm>.
3. *Culture* and *civilization* will be used interchangeably when discussing the contemporary macro-variances, -interactions, and -conflicts between Muslim and Western worlds. Of course, it is acknowledged that civilizations, as the most expansive entities of culture, are comprised of many geographic cultures (local, national, regional, etc.) and include diverse communities where different languages, social structures, religions, and ethnicities further contribute to the complex dimensions of a society or civilization. When discussing the characteristics of Islamic or Western cultures, this project seeks to remain sensitive to their various subcultures and will emphasize various intracultural complexities throughout.
4. Huntington, "Cultures in the 21st Century: Conflicts and Convergences."
5. Huntington, "If Not Civilizations, What?: Paradigms of the Post-Cold War," 194.
6. W. Cole Durham, Jr., "Perspectives on Religious Liberty: A Comparative Framework," in *Religious Human Rights in Global Perspective: Legal Perspectives*, ed. Johan D. van der Vyver and John Witte, Jr. (The Hague: Martinus Nijhoff Publishers, 1996), 4.
7. Khaled Abou El Fadl, "The Culture of Ugliness in Modern Islam and Reengaging Morality," *UCLA Journal of Islamic and Near Eastern Law* 2, no. 1 (2002/2003): 38.
8. *Ibid.* The Jewish and Christian embrace of Muslim philosophy and science in the late Middle Ages and Renaissance periods was, in general, not reciprocated by the Muslim world. Muslims continued, in large part, to view Europe as backward and of limited usefulness. Reluctantly, the Ottoman Empire, out of necessity, began to draw from Western ideas (military science, etc.). For an insightful study on the dynamics of intercultural exchange between Islam and

- the West, see Bernard Lewis's, *The Muslim Discovery of Europe* (New York: W. W. Norton, 2001).
9. Abou El Fadl, 38.
  10. *Ibid.*, 39–40.
  11. *Ibid.*, 48.
  12. *Ibid.*, 44.
  13. Fred Halliday, "West Encountering Islam: Islamophobia Reconsidered," in *Islam Encountering Globalization*, ed. Ali Mohammadi (London: Routledge Curzon, 2002), 14.
  14. Abou El Fadl, 48–49. See also Anders Jerichow, "Civilizations: Clash or Cooperation?" in *Islam in a Changing World: Europe and the Middle East*, ed. Anders Jerichow and Jørgen Baek Simonsen (Richmond, Surrey, UK: Curzon, 1997), 144–56.
  15. Abou El Fadl, 49.
  16. Mahboob A. Khawaja, *Muslims and the West: Quest for "Change" and Conflict Resolution* (Lanham, MD: University Press of America, 2000), 135–36.
  17. See, for instance, A Jerichow and J. Baek Simonsen, eds., *Islam in a Changing World: Europe and the Middle East* (Richmond, Surrey: Curzon, 1997); Colin Chapman, *Islam and the West: Conflict, Coexistence or Conversion?* (Waynesboro, GA: Paternoster, 1998); Fred Halliday, *Islam and the Myth of Confrontation* (New York: I. B. Tauris Publishers, 1999); Shireen T. Hunter, *The Future of Islam and the West: Clash of Civilizations or Peaceful Coexistence* (Westport, CT: Praeger, 1998); Jorgen S. Nielsen, ed., *The Christian-Muslim Frontier: Chaos, Clash or Dialogue* (New York: I. B. Tauris, 1998.); Dieter Senghaas, *The Clash Within Civilizations: Coming to Terms with Cultural Conflicts* (London: Routledge, 2001); Edward Said, "The Clash of Ignorance," *The Nation* 273, no. 12 (2001); Jonathan Sacks, *Dignity of Difference: How to Avoid the Clash of Civilizations*, 2nd ed. (Continuum International Publishing Group, 2003); Mark David Gismondi, "Civilisation as Paradigm: An Inquiry into the Hermeneutics of Conflict," *Geopolitics* 9, no. 2 (Summer 2004): 402–25; and Michael Novak, *The Universal Hunger for Liberty: Why the Clash of Civilizations is Not Inevitable* (New York: Basic Books, 2004).
  18. Huntington, "If Not Civilizations, What?" 194.
  19. Quoted in *ibid.*
  20. Abou El Fadl, 47.
  21. See Oliver Roy, *Globalized Islam: The Search for a New Ummah* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2004), 332.
  22. Presidential Address, September 20, 2001, available at <http://www.whitehouse.gov/>.
  23. See, for instance, <http://www.cbsnews.com/stories/2004/03/19/world/main607516.html> and <http://www.time.com/time/magazine/article/0,9171,600874-1,00.html>.
  24. For a translation and commentary on the March 12 statement of alleged responsibility by this group and its unlikely connection to al-Qaeda, see Middle East Media Research Institute at <http://memri.org/bin/articles/>.

- Spanish investigators suspect the attacks were carried out by a localized contingent of Muslim extremists, “inspired by al-Qaeda.” Twenty-nine Muslims, the majority of Moroccan origin, are being tried in Spain. <http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/europe/6665233.stm>.
25. <http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/world/europe/3523804.stm>.
  26. “I Won’t Let the Bombers Beat Me,” *BBC News*, August 4, 2005, available at <http://www.bbcnews.com/>.
  27. YouGov/ *Daily Telegraph* Survey, 8 July 2005, available at <http://www.yougov.com/>. See also Anthony King, “Britons will Never Give in to Terrorists,” July 9, 2005, available at <http://portal.telegraph.co.uk/news/>.
  28. Olivier Roy, “Europe’s Response to Radical Islam,” *Current History* 104, no. 685 (November 2005): 360.
  29. *Ibid.*.
  30. Roy, *Globalized Islam: The Search for a New Ummah*, 2. Roy defines “neofundamentalism” as a conservative, narrowly-defined, scripturalist understanding of Islam “that rejects the national and statist dimension in favour of the *ummah*, the universal community of all Muslims, based on *sharia* (Islamic law).” Such terminology appropriately describes those Muslims who have been uprooted or have migrated to the West and no longer identify with a particular nation-state. Through a “deterritorialisation” of Islam, they seek to reestablish a transnational *ummah* and restore an Islamic way of life within their minority Muslim communities. *Ibid.*, 1–2.
  31. Muhammad Talbi, “Possibilities and Conditions for a Better Understanding between Islam and the West,” *Journal of Ecumenical Studies* 25 (Spring 1988): 177.
  32. Mahmoud Ayoub, “Christian-Muslim Dialogue: Goals and Obstacles,” *The Muslim World* 94 (July 2004): 317.
  33. Lalsangkima Pachau, “Engaging the ‘Other’ in a Pluralistic World: Toward a Subaltern Hermeneutics of Christian Mission,” in *Studies in World Christianity* vol. 8, no. 1 (2002): 68.
  34. Gören Larsson, “The Impact of Global Conflicts on Local Contexts: Muslims in Sweden after 9/11—the Rise of Islamophobia, or New Possibilities,” *Islam and Christian-Muslim Relations* 16 (January 2005): 30.
  35. *Ibid.*, 31.
  36. *Ibid.*, 34. See also A. S. Roald, “Islamofobi,” in *Jalla! Nu Kär vi granen. Möte med den muslimska kultursfären* (Stockholm: Regeringskansliet, Utrikes departementet, 2002), 53; and A. S. Roald, “From ‘People’s Home’ to ‘Multiculturalism’: Muslims in Sweden,” in *Muslims in the West: From Sojourners to Citizens*, ed. Z. Y. Haddad (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002).
  37. “Dutch Face Future After Van Gogh,” *BBC News*, 7 July 2005, available at <http://www.bbcnews.com/> (accessed September 17, 2005).
  38. Quoted in Ian Buruma, *Murder in Amsterdam: The Death of Theo Van Gogh and the Limits of Tolerance* (New York: Penguin, 2006), 7.
  39. “Dutch Face Future After Van Gogh.”

40. Jenny Percival, "Why Salman Rushdie was knighted," *BBC News*, available at <http://www.bbcnews.com/>. In an era of rising sociopolitical tension between many western and majority Muslim nations and indefinite warring on terror, some policy makers are questioning the timing of Rushdie's knighthood and expressing concern over its likely potential to exacerbate cross-cultural bitterness and violence. Britain's conservative MP Stewart Jackson stated as much: "If the senior officers of the Foreign and Commonwealth Office were not able to use their knowledge of the Islamic world to consider the likely ramifications of this decision, then I'm extremely concerned." *Ibid*.
41. See Fareed Zakaria, "How We Can Prevail," *New York Times*, July 18, 2005, 39. The statement was authorized by ten *fatwas* (religious edicts by qualified jurists) that were issued from recognized scholars such as Tantawi; Iraq's Grand Ayatollah Ali Sistani; Egypt's mufti, Ali Jumaa; and the Al-Jazeera TV-sheik, Yusuf al-Qaradawi.
42. See [http://www.cair.com/Not\\_in\\_Islam\\_Name/](http://www.cair.com/Not_in_Islam_Name/). The "Not in the Name of Islam" petition reads, in part: "We, the undersigned Muslims, wish to state clearly that those who commit acts of terror, murder and cruelty in the name of Islam are not only destroying innocent lives, but are also betraying the values of the faith they claim to represent. No injustice done to Muslims can ever justify the massacre of innocent people, and no act of terror will ever serve the cause of Islam. We repudiate and dissociate ourselves from any Muslim group or individual who commits such brutal and un-Islamic acts. We refuse to allow our faith to be held hostage by the criminal actions of a tiny minority acting outside the teachings of both the Quran and the Prophet Muhammad, peace be upon him."
- "As it states in the Quran: *'Oh you who believe, stand up firmly for justice, as witnesses to God, even if it be against yourselves, or your parents, or your kin, and whether it be against rich or poor; for God can best protect both. Do not follow any passion, lest you not be just. And if you distort or decline to do justice, verily God is well-acquainted with all that you do.'*" (Quran 4:135).
43. See, for example, Khaled Abou El Fadl, "The Place of Tolerance in Islam," in *The Place of Tolerance in Islam*, ed. Joshua Cohen and Ian Lague (Boston: Beacon, 2002); Khaled Abou El Fadl, "Islam and the Challenge of Democracy," in *Islam and the Challenge of Democracy*, ed. Joshua Cohen and Deborah Chasman (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2004); Abdullahi Ahmed An-Na'im, *Toward an Islamic Reformation: Civil Liberties, Human Rights and International Law* (Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press, 1990); and David Little, John Kelsay, and Abdulaziz A. Sachedina, eds., *Human Rights and the Conflict of Cultures: Western and Islamic Perspectives on Religious Liberty* (Columbia, SC: University of South Carolina Press, 1988).
44. Larsson, 40.
45. Abou El Fadl, "The Culture of Ugliness in Modern Islam and Reengaging Morality," 34. Abou El Fadl recounts an incident in Mecca in March of 2002 that he argues should have caused public outrage and led to criminal convictions in

Saudi Arabia. According to an official report, fourteen young girls were killed—burned to death or asphyxiated by smoke—when an accidental fire destroyed their public school. According to parents, there was no way to escape the fire, as doors were locked from the outside by Saudi religious police to prevent the girls from escaping the school. Because the girls were not properly covered, the *mutawwa'un* (religious police) forbade firemen or police from rescuing them and, according to unofficial reports, actually beat some of the girls back inside the burning building. He also mentions various other “inhumane incidents in the history of modern Islam,” such as the stoning and incarceration of rape victims in Nigeria and Pakistan, the excommunication of writers in Egypt, the degradation of women by the Taliban, and the demolition of ancient Buddha statues in Afghanistan. *Ibid.*, 33–35.

46. *Ibid.*, 50.
47. Seyyed Hossein Nasr, *Islam: Religion, History, and Civilization* (San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco, 2003), 178–79. Nasr laments the Western tendency to label these various Islamic resurgence movements in the Muslim world as *fundamentalism*—a word derived from an “American Protestant context,” later conferred upon Islam. Such a term is misleading and adds confusion by dismissing many variations of Islamic revivalism taking place in Muslim societies. In fact, he argues that a “great majority of Muslims” are expressing the desire to reassert their religiocultural identity. Such Islamic revivalism should not be indiscriminately labeled “fundamentalism,” Nasr cautions, because “most people who share these ideals are traditional Muslims.” Fundamentalism will be addressed in further detail in chapter four. It is a term that essentially represents only those puritanical movements that seek to reform wayward Muslim societies through a more narrowly-defined interpretation and “strict application” of *Islamic law* that not only contests the invasion of Western ideas but also dismisses the “intellectual, artistic, and mystical traditions of Islam” as historical aberrations, antithetical to the Islamic way of life. See *ibid.*, 179–80.
48. *Ibid.*, 179–80.
49. Khurram Murad, “Prophethood: Root Cause of Islam-West Conflict,” *Tarjuman al-Qur’an* (July 1992), available at <http://www.jamaat.org/>.
50. Kurshid Ahmed, “US Leadership and World’s Conscience,” available at <http://www.jamaat.org/>.
51. Saba Mahmood, “Is Liberalism Islam’s Only Answer?” in *Islam and the Challenge of Democracy*, 77.
52. Huntington, “The West: Unique, not Universal,” 41.
53. *Ibid.*
54. *Ibid.*, 30–35.
55. *Ibid.*, 41.
56. *Ibid.*, 40.
57. Based on the 2007 BP Global Report, at the end of 2006 61.5 percent of the proved oil reserves were located in the Middle East (Iran-11.4 percent, Iraq-9.5 percent, Kuwait-8.4 percent, Oman 0.5 percent, Qatar-1.3 percent, Saudi



- Arabia-21.9 percent, Syria-0.2 percent, United Arab Emirates-8.1 percent, and Yemen-0.2 percent). See *Statistical Review of World Energy 2007* at <http://www.bp.com>.
58. Stanley Kurtz, "Text and Context," in *The Place of Tolerance in Islam*, ed. Joshua Cohen and Ian Lague (Boston: Beacon, 2002), 53–54.
  59. Talbi, 170.
  60. Akbar Ahmed, *Journey into Islam: The Crisis of Globalization* (Washington, DC: Brookings, 2007), 225.
  61. According to Ahmed, the uncertainty of life for Muslims in Afghanistan and Iraq has caused many to look back "with nostalgia to recent times that offered some semblance of stability," preferring "the harshest of religious governments" (the Taliban in Afghanistan) "or the worst dictator" (Saddam in Iraq) to the sociopolitical circumstances following the American-led invasions. *Ibid.*, 226.
  62. See, for instance, Khaled Abou El Fadl, "The Place of Tolerance in Islam." While a realist perspective may conclude that "balance of power" politics will perpetuate Western intrusions until Muslim states can acquire the geopolitical ability to remedy this imbalance, liberal internationalism would suggest that equalization can begin now through international mediating organizations such as the United Nations. Yet there is concern from many Muslim intellectuals and political leaders that organizations such as the United Nations, the World Trade Organization, and the International Monetary Fund possess inherently Western biases that prohibit a genuine respect for cultural equality and global unanimity.
  63. Richard K. Betts, "The Soft Underbelly of American Primacy: Tactical Advantages of Terror," *Political Science Quarterly* 11, no. 1 (Spring 2002); also in *Conflicts after the Cold War: Arguments on Causes of War and Peace*, 2nd ed., ed. Richard K. Betts (New York: PearsonLongman, 2005), 536.
  64. Samuel P. Huntington, "The West: Unique, Not Universal," *Foreign Affairs* 75 (November/December 1996), 37.
  65. Akbar S. Ahmed, *Postmodernism and Islam: Predicament and Promise* (New York: Routledge, 1992), 98.
  66. Huntington, "If Not Civilizations, What?: Paradigms of the Post-Cold War," 37.
  67. Ahmed, *Postmodernism and Islam*, 98.
  68. Benjamin Barber, *Jihad vs. McWorld: How Globalism and Tribalism are Reshaping the World* (New York: Times Books, 1995).
  69. Benjamin Barber, "Beyond Jihad vs. McWorld," *The Nation* (January 21, 2002): 17.
  70. Ahmed, *Postmodernism and Islam*, 197.
  71. Huntington, "If Not Civilizations, What?: Paradigms of the Post-Cold War," 194.
  72. Nasr, *Islam*, 185–86.
  73. Abdullah Saeed and Hassan Saeed, *Freedom of Religion, Apostasy and Islam* (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2004), 13.

74. See Youssef K. El-Hage, "Human Rights: A Western Christian Invention?" in *The Near East School of Theology Theological Review* vol. 25, no. 2 (November 2004): 12–14. While the UDHR was approved with a unanimous vote by the General Assembly, Saudi Arabia abstained from voting, and Egypt officially objected to Article 18's freedom to change one's religion. U.N. Doc. A/PV.183, at 913 (1948); see also El-Hage, 14.
75. U.N. Doc. A/C.3/SR.127, 391–92 (1948); see also El-Hage, 13–14. Demonstrating the often unappreciated complexity and diversity of Islamic civilization, Pakistan's foreign minister Muhammad Zafrulla Khan told the plenary session of the General Assembly in 1948 that the language on religious liberty in Article 18 of the UDHR was entirely consistent with the tenets of Islam. While sympathetic to Baroody's concerns over the historical relationship between Christian missionary work and its potential political motivations, Khan held firm to his belief that the freedom to change one's religion was compatible with his interpretation of Islam. El-Hage, 14–15. See also Saeed and Saeed, 14. From Khan's Muslim perspective, "the Moslem religion was a missionary religion: it strove to persuade men to change their faith and alter their way of living, so as to follow the faith and way of living it preached, but it recognized the same right of conversion for other religions as for itself." Plenary Meetings of the General Assembly, 183rd Plenary Meeting, December 10, 1948, 890; see also El-Hage, 14–15. It is important to note, however, that Zafrulla Khan was an Ahmadi, a member of the Ahmadiyya Muslim sect that is openly persecuted in Pakistan today. Through anti-blasphemy provisions, Ahmadis are no longer recognized as Muslims. Thus, it is impossible that in Pakistan today a "heterodox" Ahmadi would be placed in the position of foreign minister. As such, Khan's interpretation of Islam would be largely dismissed by many jurists and leaders within contemporary Islamic civilization. Still, the words of this once-respected "Muslim" are significant.
76. Saeed and Saeed, 16. There are, of course, dissident voices of Muslim intellectuals from Western and Islamic venues who are challenging the severity of punishment for apostasy dictated in the *shari'a*. For example, Mohamed Talbi, history professor at the University of Tunis, argues that the Qur'an speaks of a harsh penalty for apostasy in eternity but provides no explicit injunction for temporal punishment in this life.
77. *Ibid.*, 16–19. The Universal Islamic Declaration of Human Rights (1981) and the Cairo Declaration on Human Rights in Islam (1990) adopt a more limited definition of religious freedom than that espoused in the UDHR. Neither document directly addresses the right to change one's religion.
78. Bernard Lewis, *Islam and the West* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1993), 5. Bernard Lewis states: "It is now a commonplace that the term 'Islam' is the counterpart not only of 'Christianity' but also of 'Christendom'—not only a religion in the narrow Western sense but of a whole civilization which grew up under the aegis of that religion." *Ibid.*, 4.
79. *Ibid.*, 7–8.
80. *Ibid.*, 5–6.

81. Simon Jargy, *Islam et Chrétienté* (Geneva: Labor et Fides, 1981), 10; quoted in Talbi, "Possibilities and Conditions for a Better Understanding Between Islam and the West," 162.
82. Talbi, 174.
83. Lewis, *Islam and the West*, 17.
84. For example, history and religious studies professor Phillip Jenkins predicts that six nations (Brazil, Mexico, Philippines, Nigeria, D. R. Congo, and the United States) each may have 100 million Christians or greater by 2050, with only one of those countries (United States) coming from the developed West. Philip Jenkins, *The Next Christendom: The Coming of Global Christianity*, 2nd ed. (New York: Oxford University Press, 2007), 104–5. What is more, he shows how those countries that currently have the highest birth rates are "neatly divided between mainly Christian states, such as Uganda and Bolivia, and solidly Muslim nations, such as Yemen and Afghanistan." *Ibid.*, 191.
85. Madeline Albright, "Faith and Diplomacy," *The Review of Faith & International Affairs* (Fall 2006): 3–9. The former U.S. Secretary of State writes: "Studies indicate that wars with a religious component last longer and are fought more savagely than other conflicts." In her assessment of religion and conflict, Albright calls on U.S. diplomats to develop a greater understanding (expertise) and appreciation of religion's role in numerous conflicts around the world. Only then can policy makers and conflict negotiators "anticipate events rather than respond to them." Her analysis concludes by asserting religion's immutable place in contemporary international relations, and, while remaining wary of a manipulated religion's propensity to justify violence, she encourages policy makers to welcome religion's role in reinforcing the "core values necessary for people from different cultures to live together in some degree of harmony." See *ibid.*, 3, 4, and 9. See also Madeline Albright, *The Mighty and the Almighty: Reflections on America, God, and World Affairs* (New York: Harper Perennial, 2007).
86. For a concise overview of this trend, see Jenkins, 196–214.
87. Seyyed Hossein Nasr, "Metaphysical Roots of Tolerance and Intolerance: An Islamic Interpretation," in *Philosophy, Religion, and the Question of Intolerance*, ed. Mehdi Amin Razavi and David Ambuel (New York: State University of New York Press, 1997), 50.
88. Mohammed Arkoun, "Is Islam Threatened by Christianity," *Cross Currents* 45, no. 4 (1995/1996): 470.
89. *Ibid.*, 471.
90. Jenkins, 189.
91. The controversial passage from Manuel II used by Pope Benedict XVI states, "Show me just what Mohammed brought that was new, and there you will find things only evil and inhuman, such as his command to spread by the sword the faith he preached."
92. George Friedman, "Faith, Reason and Politics: Parsing the Pope's Remarks," a Stratfor geopolitical intelligence report (September 19, 2006), available at <http://Stratfor.com>.

93. Nasr, "An Islamic Interpretation," 55.
94. Talbi, 187.
95. Professor Abdullahi An-Na'im made this distinction during a keynote address on reframing human rights in Berlin, Germany on October 4, 2005. I participated the following day in a roundtable discussion with An-Na'im that pursued the issue of human rights and cultural consensus further.
96. Pachau, 68.
97. Talbi, 182.
98. *Ibid.*, 183.
99. *Ibid.*, 189–91.

## Chapter 2

1. Michael Gervers and James M. Powell, eds., *Tolerance and Intolerance: Social Conflict in the Age of the Crusades* (Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press, 2001), xvii. See also John Christian Laursen and Cary J. Nederman, eds., *Beyond the Persecuting Society: Religious Toleration Before the Enlightenment* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1998), 1–10.
2. Cary J. Nederman and John Christian Laursen, eds., *Difference and Dissent: Theories of Toleration in Medieval and Early Modern Europe* (Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield, 1996); John Christian Laursen and Cary J. Nederman, eds., *Beyond the Persecuting Society: Religious Toleration before the Enlightenment* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1998). Other works include John Christian Laursen, ed., *Religious Toleration: "The Variety of Rites" from Cyrus to Defoe* (New York: St. Martin's, 1999); Cary J. Nederman, *Worlds of Difference: European Discourse of Toleration, c. 1100–c. 1550* (University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2001); John Christian Laursen and Cary J. Nederman, "The Problem of Periodization in the History of Toleration," *Storia della Storiographica* 37 (2000): 55–65.
3. Nederman and Laursen, "Difference and Dissent: Introduction," in *Difference and Dissent*, 5.
4. Heiko A. Oberman, "The Travail of Tolerance: Containing Chaos in Early Modern Europe," in *Tolerance and Intolerance in the European Reformation*, ed. Ole Peter Grell and Bob Scribner (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996), 13. Oberman references Joseph Lecler's fascinating two-volume study, *Toleration and the Reformation*, trans. T. L. Westow (New York: Association, 1960). Lecler's exhaustive examination covers a wide berth of prominent and peripheral proponents of tolerance across a wide geographical range from England to Transylvania. Oberman applauds Lecler's expansive scholarship and acknowledgement of the effects of political context, but he points to Lecler's reinforcement of intellectual history as the primary perimeter of the debate. *Ibid.*
5. *Ibid.*, 29. Ole Peter Grell offers Martin Luther's theological evolution in the area of tolerance as one example of how social, political, and religious considerations

- pressed Luther to modify his argument significantly. “Within less than a decade,” writes Grell, “Luther had moved from an outsider’s position, hoping and wanting to reform the whole Church to that of an insider who sought to protect and secure the existence of the Protestant churches already established.” Consequently, subsequent works on tolerance that utilized Luther’s writings (such as Sebastian Castellio’s *De haereticis an sint persequendi* (1554)) only reference his early arguments, while necessarily neglecting his later positions. Ole Peter Grell, “Introduction,” in *Tolerance and Intolerance in the European Reformation*, 5–6.
6. John Christian Laursen and Cary J. Nederman, “General Introduction: Political and Historical Myths in the Toleration Literature,” in *Beyond the Persecuting Society*, 7.
  7. *Ibid.*, 7.
  8. *Ibid.*, 7–8.
  9. Bernard Hamilton, *The Medieval Inquisition* (New York: Holmes & Meier Publishers, Inc., 1989), 16.
  10. Tertullian, *Of Patience*, in *Latin Christianity: Its Founder Tertullian*, ed. Alexander Roberts and James Donaldson, trans. Rev. S. Thelwall (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson Publishers, Inc., 1994), Chapter Five—Of Revenge, 713.
  11. Tertullian, *Liber ad Scapulum*; in *Latin Christianity: Its Founder Tertullian*, ed. Alexander Roberts and James Donaldson, trans. Rev. S. Thelwall (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson Publishers, Inc., 1994), 105.
  12. Inspired by a suggestion made by Sister Francis Mary in her introduction to Lactantius, *On the Deaths of the Persecutors*, in Sister Francis Mary McDonald, ed. and trans., *Lactantius: The Minor Works* (Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 1965), 127–28.
  13. Gelarius was a notorious persecutor of Christians, instigating and supporting Diocletian’s brutal policies of intolerance. Gelarius’ declaration of tolerance was approbated the year of his death.
  14. Licinius would return to persecuting Christians and ultimately be defeated in a power struggle with Constantine and executed.
  15. Lactantius, *Divine Institutes*, trans. Anthony Bowen and Peter Garnsey (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 2003), 5.20.23–26.
  16. *Ibid.*, 5.20.7, 9.
  17. *Ibid.*, 5.19.11.
  18. *Ibid.*, 5.19, 20.
  19. *Ibid.*, 5.19.26.
  20. *Ibid.*, 5.22.1–5.
  21. *Ibid.*, 6.18.2
  22. *Ibid.*, 6.18
  23. *Ibid.*, 6.18.32.
  24. Tertullian, *Of Patience*, Of Revenge, 713.
  25. For example, the *Oxford English Dictionary* defines tolerance as “the action or practice of enduring or sustaining pain or hardship; the power or capacity of enduring.”

26. *Divine Institutes*, 6.18.29–33.
27. Lactantius, *Divine Institutes* 7.10.5–9.
28. Lactantius, of course, devoted a significant portion of his *Divine Institutes* to the violent and intolerant nature of paganism. Other minor works, such as his pamphlet *On the Deaths of the Persecutors*, also relay this persistent theme.
29. See Anthony Bowen's and Peter Garnsey's introduction to Lactantius, *Divine Institutes*, 48.
30. Lactantius, *On the Death of the Persecutors* 1.5.
31. *Ibid.*, 6.18.18–19.
32. Brian Tierney, *The Crisis of Church and State 1050–1300* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1999), 16.
33. Brian Tierney, "Religious Rights: An Historical Perspective," in *Religious Human Rights in Global Perspective: Religious Perspectives*, ed. John Witte, Jr. and Johan D. van der Vyver (The Hague: Martinus Nijhoff, 1996), 31.
34. See Heinrich Fichtenau, *Ketzer und Professoren: Häresie und Vernunftglaube im Hochmittelalter* (Munich: C. H. Beck'sche Verlagsbuchhandlung, 1992).
35. Bernard Hamilton, 17.
36. *Ibid.*, 18.
37. *Ibid.*, 19–20. Bernard Hamilton and Heinrich Fichtenau both distinguish between academic skeptics or intellectual heresies (confined to theological technicalities and complex doctrinal debates), where the potential for generating a popular following was unlikely, and those popular heresies that posed a real threat of exacting significant support from the masses, potentially undermining the institutional Church.
38. Tierney, "Religious Rights: An Historical Perspective," 25.
39. Thomas Aquinas, *Summa theologiae*, trans. Fathers of the Dominican English Province (Westminster, MD: Christian Classics, 1981), 2.2ae.39.4.
40. *Ibid.*, 2.2ae.10.9.
41. Hamilton, 33. See also Tierney, *The Crisis of Church and State*, 139–42.
42. *The Constitutions of Melfi*, J. Powell, trans. (Syracuse University Press, 1971), 7; quoted in Tierney, "Religious Rights: An Historical Perspective," 31.
43. Hamilton, 33. In 1224, under Frederick II, the secular penalty for heresy was burning; if clemency was granted, however, the heretic's tongue was to be cut out. *Ibid.*
44. Tierney, *The Crisis of Church and State*, 139; and Hamilton, 33..
45. Hamilton, 72–73.
46. Tierney, "Religious Rights: An Historical Perspective," 25–26. This general tolerance toward Jews and Muslims waned significantly in the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries, as forced baptisms, massacres, and ultimatums of conversions or exile grew in frequency (especially during the "reconquests" of Ferdinand and Isabella).
47. R. I. Moore, *The Formation of a Persecuting Society: Power and Deviance in Western Europe, 950–1250* (New York: Basil Blackwell, 1987). Regarding Rouen and the first crusade, the monk Guibert of Nogent recorded the following occurrence: "At Rouen, one day, some men who had taken the cross

- with the intention of leaving for the crusade began complaining among themselves. 'Here we are,' they said, 'going off to attack God's enemies in the East, having to travel tremendous distances, when the Jews are right here before our very eyes. No race is more hostile to God than they are. Our project is insane!' Having said this they armed themselves, rounded up some Jews in a church—whether by force or by ruse I don't know—and led them out to put them to the sword regardless of age or sex. Those who agreed to submit to the Christian way of life could, however, escape the impending slaughter." Guibert of Nogent, *A Monk's Confession: The Memoirs of Guibert of Nogent*, trans. Paul J. Archambault (University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1998), 111. While clerical propagators of the crusades, like Bernard of Clairvaux, made attempts to prevent violent persecution of Jews, arguing that scripture warranted dispersion only, "the preaching and preparation of crusades" and "religious fervour and social unrest associated with them, continued to represent danger for the Jews." Moore, 31.
48. Bernard Lewis, *Islam and the West* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1993), 7–9. "For almost a thousand years," writes Lewis, "from the first Moorish landing in Spain to the second Turkish siege of Vienna, Europe was under constant threat from Islam." It was a "double threat" in the first few centuries, he continues, "not only of invasion and conquest, but also of conversion and assimilation." *Ibid.*, 13.
  49. Avicenna (Ibn Sina), al-Kindi, al-Farabi, and Averroes (Ibn Rushd) were all Muslim scholars (often renounced by Islamic clergy for their religious mysticism) who produced important commentaries on Aristotle. Averroes (Ibn Rushd) was largely unknown in the early twelfth century but later became the most important Muslim (Spanish-Arab) scholar to Western (especially Parisian) philosophers. See Heinrich Fichtenau, 317–18. In fact, the Grand Commentator, as he was titled, was at that time more influential to Christian thought than Islamic.
  50. Nederman, "Introduction: Discourses and Contexts of Tolerance in Medieval Europe," in *Beyond the Persecuting Society*, 19–20.
  51. Nederman, *Worlds of Difference*, 25. (Why is this deleted? More than one Nederman source is used in this chapter.)
  52. Chapter 2 of Nederman's *Worlds of Difference*, "Demonstration and Mutual Edification in Inter-religious Dialogue," provides an insightful study of tolerance and the medieval genre of inter-religious dialogue.
  53. See Peter Abelard, *Dialogue of a Philosopher with a Jew and a Christian*, trans. Pierre J. Payer (Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Medieval Studies, 1979). Peter Abelard experienced persecution and intolerance as a heretic. He was castrated in 1117 and charged with heresy twice, first at the Council of Soissons in 1121 and then by Bernard of Clairvaux in 1140 at the Council of Sens. See Constant J. Mews, "Peter Abelard and the Enigma of Dialogue," in *Beyond the Persecuting Society*, 25. Mews highlights a major difference between Abelard's dialogue and the popular philosophical dialogues of Anselm of Canterbury (1033–1109) a century earlier (*Se vertate, De casu diaboli, De libertate arbitrio*)

and Anselm's pupil Gilbert of Crispin (*Disputatio Iudei et Christiani*). Rather than using the philosopher for the sole purpose of demonstrating Christianity's inherent logic ("the rightness of one's point of view"), Abelard's dialogue avoided religious dogmatism and, instead, endeavored to understand competing viewpoints (that of a philosopher, Jew, and Christian) and emphasize a common agenda of reaching the supreme good. Abelard, of course, agreed that the Christian faith was superior and demonstrable through reason, but was unique for his criticism of Christendom's authoritarian intolerance of those beyond the Christian worldview. *Ibid.*, 39–40. In a morally instructive poem, the *Carmen ad Astralabium*, addressed to his son, Abelard raises the issue of lasting human difference: "The world is divided among so many sects that what may be the path of life is hardly clear. Because the world harbors so many conflicting dogmas, each makes his own, by way of his own background. In the end, no one dares rely on reason in these things, while he wants to live in some kind of peace with himself. Each person sins only by having contempt for God—only contempt can make this person guilty." Quoted in Mew, 44. Thus, as Mew concludes, for Abelard, "only contempt of God, not ignorance, is truly sinful." *Ibid.* His open-ended dialogue was an original argument for tolerating disagreement and difference while raising the edifying nature of inter-religious discussion.

54. Nederman, *Words of Difference*, 6.
55. J. N. Hillgarth, *The Spanish Kingdoms 1250–1516: Precarious Balance*, vol. 1 (London: Oxford University Press, 1976), 247.
56. Havelock Ellis, "Ramon Lull at Palma," in *The Soul of Spain* (London, 1937), 203; quoted in J. N. Hillgarth, *Ramon Lull and Lulism in Fourteenth-Century France* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1971), 2.
57. Hillgarth, *The Spanish Kingdoms 1250–1516*, vol. 1, 27.
58. *Ibid.*, 239–40.
59. See Anthony Bonner's "Historical Background," in *Selected Works of Ramon Llull (1232–1316)*, vol. 1 (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1985), 10.
60. Llull was successful at the end of his life in influencing the Council of Vienne in 1311 to support his goal of establishing a school of oriental languages. Canon 11 of the Council sanctioned the instruction of Arabic, "Chaldean," and Hebrew at Paris, Oxford, Salamanca, Bologna, and the Papal Courts to those being trained as missionaries. See *Doctor Illuminatus: A Ramon Llull Reader*, trans. and ed. Anthony Bonner (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1985), 41.
61. "Contemporary Life," in Bonner, *Doctor Illuminatus: A Ramon Llull Reader*, 28–29.
62. *Ibid.*, 30.
63. Bonner, *Doctor Illuminatus*, 46. Bonner suggests that "for the sake of persuasion," Llull was not beyond adjusting his sociopolitical arguments: "Llull sought to persuade in order to save souls; consistency of personal social convictions was for him less important." *Ibid.*
64. *Ibid.*, 46–47.



65. *Ibid.*, 81–82. All except for the surviving Spanish translation appear to have been translated during Lull’s lifetime. *Ibid.*
66. Nederman, *Worlds of Difference*, 30.
67. Bonner, *Doctor Illuminatus*, 80.
68. Nederman, *Worlds of Difference*, 30.
69. Bonner, *Doctor Illuminatus*, 78.
70. Nederman, *Worlds of Difference*, 30.
71. Ramon Llull, *The Book of the Gentile and the Three Wise Men*, trans. Anthony Bonner in *The Selected Works of Ramon Llull (1232–1316)*, 1:113.
72. *Ibid.*, 1:300. In the Epilogue, the Gentile emerges from the dialogue illuminated by the path of salvation and begins to worship God in prayer. As he emotionally recounts the charitable, prudent, patient, and self-restrained nature of God, the three wise men were reminded of their own sinful state and convicted to reclaim a devotion to the divine virtues of God commensurate with that of the Gentile. *Ibid.*, 1:299–300.
73. As mentioned earlier, regarding the Other, the voluntary nature of faith played a prominent role in medieval doctrine. Llull, however, is not dealing with an apostate Jew, Christian, or Muslim but an unbelieving, searching Gentile. It is unlikely that an apostate would have found similar sympathy from these religious wise men.
74. Llull, 1:303.
75. Nederman, *Worlds of Difference*, 36.
76. Llull, 1:304.
77. Ole Peter Grell and Bob Scribner, eds., *Tolerance and Intolerance in the European Reformation*. Grell writes that, according to traditional scholarship (he references W. K. Jordan’s four-volume work, *The Development of Religious Toleration in England*, and Joseph Lecler’s two-volume study, *Toleration and the Reformation*), the Age of Reason was initiated with the tolerance of humanists like Erasmus and Thomas More, followed by the “bigotry and intolerance of the first decades of the Reformation” (he references Calvin, Knox, and Beza), culminating in the religious wars and “a gradual tiredness of constant religious confrontation.” This led to a waning religious zeal at the close of the sixteenth century, which paved the way for “a common-sense tolerance of religious differences.” *Ibid.*, 1. The post-Reformation argument then asserts that, in response to the horrors and chaos associated with the sixteenth- and seventeenth-century religious wars, a broadened Enlightenment understanding of tolerance emerged (motivated by pragmatism and progress).
78. Ole Peter Grell, “Introduction,” in *Tolerance and Intolerance in the European Reformation*, 10.
79. Genesis 19; Joshua 5, 6; John 10:16 *NIV* (New International Version).
80. The *Requerimiento* was written by Spanish jurist and professor Juan López de Palacios Rubios of the Council of Castille and approbated by King Ferdinand as a legal instrument for achieving the imperial mission of the Church.

81. Quoted in George Sanderlin, ed., *Witness: Writings of Bartolomé de Las Casas*, foreword by Gustavo Gutiérrez (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 1992), xiii-xiv.
82. Lesley Byrd Simpson, *The Encomienda in New Spain* (Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1950), 36–37.
83. See *ibid.*, 37.
84. *Ibid.*
85. Quoted in *Witness*, xv.
86. Las Casas, *Apologetic History*; quoted in *Witness*, 175.
87. Las Casas, *In Defense of the Indians*, trans. and ed. Safford Poole (DeKalb, IL: Northern Illinois University Press, 1974), 41.
88. Qur'an 2:256.
89. Quoted in Bartolomé de Las Casas, *The Only Way*, trans. Francis Patrick Sullivan, S.J., ed. Helen Rand Parish (Mahwah, NJ: Paulist, 1992), 96.
90. *Ibid.* The famous debate in Valladolid (1550–51) between Juan Ginés de Sepúlveda and Las Casas offers another scintillating resource for demonstrating how one of the most significant writers on tolerance in the sixteenth century challenged the spiritual-temporal dichotomies of Western civilization. For an insightful and concise article on the role of tolerance in this famous debate, see Gerardo López Sastre, “National Prejudice and Religion in the Toleration Debate between Bartolomé de Las Casas and Juan Ginés de Sepúlveda,” in *Religious Toleration: “The Variety of Rites” from Cyrus to Defoe*, ed. John Christian Laursen (New York: St. Martin’s, 1999). In addition, for a thoughtful study on Las Casas’s use of *dominium*, as it had been systematized in the theology of Aquinas, see Paul J. Cornish, “Spanish Thomism and the American Indians: Vitoria and Las Casas on the Toleration of Cultural Difference,” in *Difference and Dissent*. See also Lewis Hanke, *Aristotle and the American Indians* (Chicago: H. Regnery Co., 1959).
91. Las Casas, *The Only Way*, 122–23.
92. *Ibid.*, 96–97.
93. Quoted in *ibid.*, 152.
94. *Ibid.*, 123.
95. *Ibid.*, 155–56.
96. *Ibid.*, 80.
97. Henry Kamen is one of several scholars to make this suggestion. See Henry Kamen, *The Rise of Toleration* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1967), 8.
98. Las Casas, *The Only Way*, 96.
99. *Ibid.*, 136.
100. Kevin Terraciano, “The Spanish Struggle for Justification in the Conquest of America,” in *Religious Toleration: “The Variety of Rites” from Cyrus to Defoe*, 106.
101. *Ibid.*, 120.
102. See Marion Leathers Daniels Kuntz’s introduction to Jean Bodin’s, *Colloquium of the Seven about Secrets of the Sublime*, trans. Marion Leathers Daniels Kuntz (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1975), xv-xxviii.
103. Quoted in Kuntz, xxvi.

104. *Ibid.*, xxiv.
105. *Ibid.*, lxiii.
106. Ingrid Creppell, *Toleration and Identity: Foundations in Early Modern Thought* (New York: Routledge, 2003), 40–49.
107. Kuntz, lxv.
108. *Ibid.*, lxvi.
109. Jean Bodin, *Colloquium*, trans. Marion Leathers Daniels Kuntz (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1975), 147.
110. *Ibid.*, 148.
111. *Ibid.*, 151. Bodin selects the Muslim participant, Octavius, to introduce the moral dilemma of the erring conscience. Lecler, *Toleration and the Reformation*, 2:182. Octavius quotes Thomas Aquinas' well-known statement: "When errant reason has established something as a precept of God, then it is the same thing to scorn the dictate of reason and the commands of God." Bodin, 157–58. In other words, one is compelled to follow his conscience. The purity of spirit and inviolable conscience that Aquinas and Scholasticism had applied to moral issues Octavius, to the chagrin of the *Colloquium's* more conservative participants, now "extends to religion at large." Lecler, *Toleration and the Reformation*, 2:182.
- In his *Six livres de la république* (*Six Books of a Commonwealth*, 1576), Bodin also illustrated the Ottoman's anachronistic level of communal tolerance: "The great emperor of the Turks doth with as great devotion as any prince in the world honor and observe the religion of others; but to the contrary permitteth every man to live according to his conscience, yea and that more is, near unto his palace at Pera, suffereth four diverse religions, viz, that of the Jews, that of the Christians, that of the Grecians, and that of the Mahometans . . . the people of ancient time were persuaded, as were the Turks, all sorts of religions which proceed from a pure mind, to be accountable to God." Bodin, *Six Books of the Commonwealth*, trans. Kenneth D. McRae, ed. Kenneth D. McRae (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1962), IV, 7, 537–38; also quoted in Creppell, 47.
112. Bodin, 468.
113. *Ibid.*, 469–71.
114. *Ibid.*, 465. In Revelation 3:15–16 NRSV (New Revised Standard Version), God declared to the church in Laodicea, "I know your works; you are neither cold nor hot. I wish that you were either cold or hot. So, because you are lukewarm, and neither cold nor hot, I am about to spit you out of my mouth."
115. Bodin, 465.
116. *Ibid.*, 471.
117. Lecler, 184.
118. *Ibid.*
119. Bodin, 471.
120. Creppell, 62–63.
121. Quoted in Kuntz, xxvi.

122. Moreover, tolerance was often seen as “co-dependent” with a number of virtues, including charity, respect, humility, patience, and goodwill. This suggestion is made by Budziszewski, 7. Furthermore, Budziszewski argues that true tolerance, in fact, is a virtue; but this will be discussed in chapter three.
123. *Ibid.*, 225.
124. *Ibid.*, 7.
125. Nederman, *Worlds of Difference*, 121.

### Chapter 3

1. *CIA Factbook*, available at <http://www.cia.gov/cia/publications/factbook/index.html>; cited in Philip Jenkins, *God's Continent: Christianity, Islam, and Europe's Religious Crisis* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2007), 16.
2. See the Central Institute's Archives (2005). The statistics were drawn from a concise article by Wolfgang Polzer, “More than 53 Million Muslims in Europe,” *WorldNetDaily*, October 22, 2005, available at <http://www.worldnetdaily.com/news/article/>. See also the Migration Policy Institute at <http://www.migrationinformation.org/Resources.cfm>.
3. Jenkins, 118.
4. Demographic, Social and Economic Indicators, UNFPA State of World Population 2005, available at <http://www.un.org/esa/population/publications/wpp2006/>.
5. Jenkins, 118.
6. Oliver Roy, *Globalized Islam: The Search for a New Ummah* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2004), 16.
7. Jenkins, 113.
8. The UNFP's net migration is based on the number of immigrants minus the number of emigrants. The medium variant is set at 951,000. Available at <http://esa.un.org/unpp/p2k0data.asp>.
9. Roy, 19.
10. Michael Walzer, *On Toleration* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1997), 37–40.
11. France is still recognized as having one of the top ten largest Catholic communities in the world. The low levels of “active” participation and attendance, however, clearly affect the significance of this statistic. See Jenkins, 29–32. In addition, though Catholicism still holds the number one spot among religions in France, Philip Jenkins offers evidence demonstrating the drastic decline in Catholic leadership in the country. For instance, in 2004 ninety men were ordained by the Catholic Church in France—compared to 566 men ordained in 1966. “In the 1990s alone, the number entering French seminaries fell from 1,200 to 900.” Jenkins, 33. In contrast to a declining Catholic population, Muslims in contemporary France, currently 8 to 10 percent of the nation's populace, are projected to represent 20 to 25 percent of the French total by 2050. Jenkins, 118.

12. *Associated Press Report*, “French Panel Backs School Ban on Head Scarves,” available at <http://foxnews.com/> (accessed January 2006).
13. See *ibid.*; “President’s risky move,” *BBC News*, available at <http://news.bbc.co.uk/> (accessed January 2006).
14. Jenkins, 197.
15. *BBC*, “President’s risky move.”
16. *Ibid.*
17. Another example occurred in Italy when an Italian Muslim activist recently went to court to have a local public school remove the crucifix on display in his son’s classroom, and the local magistrate agreed; vigorous debate and outrage occurred across the nation. Such national outrage led many Muslims to perceive that in a Western secular society, steeped in centuries of Christian tradition, some religions still have greater freedom than others. See “Italian Muslims Fear ‘Crucifix’ Fallout,” *BBC News*, available at <http://www.bbcnews.com/>. In Germany debate over the “freedom” of Muslim school teachers to wear the headscarves in public schools continues—state legislatures have been given the authority to protect or disallow this privilege.
18. Michael Walzer, *On Toleration* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1997), 84.
19. *Ibid.*, 84–85.
20. *Ibid.*, 26. For a thought-provoking look at the realities of banal discrimination toward minority cultures in the UK, see Eileen Barker, “Banal Discrimination: Equality of Respect for Beliefs and Worldviews in the UK,” in *International Perspectives on Freedom and Equality of Religious Belief*, ed. Derek Davis and Gerhard Besier (Waco, TX: J. M. Dawson Institute of Church-State Studies, Baylor University, 2002). Banal discrimination is generally defined as a “common unthinking discrimination” that encourages traditional, cultural, and social boundaries that ensure a “normalcy” or status quo in society. See Barker, 31.
21. Walzer, 26.
22. *Ibid.*, 26–28.
23. For a discussion of liberal tolerance as “non-judgmental,” see Michael Sandel, “Judgmental Toleration,” in *Natural Law, Liberalism, and Morality: Contemporary Essays*, ed. Robert George (New York: Oxford University Press, 1996), 107–12.
24. Liberal theorist Ronald Dworkin emphasizes the value of an ethically neutral body politic, demanding that the government be neutral “on what might be called the question of the good life.” Quoted in Budziszewski, 25; and in Gary Remer, “Bodin’s Pluralistic Theory of Toleration,” in *Difference and Dissent*, ed. Cary J. Nederman and John Christian Laursen (Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield, 1996), 119. See Ronald Dworkin, *A Matter of Principle* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1985), 181–204. See also Bruce Ackerman, *Social Justice in the Liberal State* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1980); and John Rawls, *A Theory of Justice* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1971). See also J Budziszewski’s challenge to ethical neutralism

- in his chapter "Arguments for Ethical Neutrality," in *True Tolerance* (New Brunswick, NJ: Transaction Publishers, 2000), 61–101.
25. In the words of Clermont-Tonnerre, who advocated Jewish emancipation in late eighteenth-century France: "It would be repugnant to have a society of non-citizens in the state, and a nation within a nation." See Gary Kates, "Jews into Frenchmen: Nationality and Representation in Revolutionary France," in *Social Research* 56 (Spring 1989): 229; partially quoted in Walzer, 39.
  26. Walzer, 88.
  27. *Ibid.*, 89. See also Nederman and Laursen, "Difference and Dissent: Introduction," in *Difference and Dissent: Theories of Toleration in Medieval and Early Modern Europe*, ed. Cary J. Nederman and John Christian Laursen (Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield, 1996), 4.
  28. Nederman and Laursen, 4. Cary J. Nederman and John Christian Laursen highlight the recent challenges to the tolerance claims of contemporary Western society from communitarian political theorists. *Ibid.*, 3–4.
  29. A. J. Conyers, *The Long Truce: How Toleration Made the World Safe for Power and Profit* (Dallas: Spence Publishing Company, 2001), 9.
  30. *Ibid.*, 17.
  31. Walzer, 25.
  32. Conyers, 10.
  33. *Ibid.*, 51.
  34. *Ibid.*, 5–12.
  35. See David B. Burrell's insightful analysis on the authenticity of the modern conception of freedom. "Freedom and Creation in the Abrahamic Traditions." *International Philosophical Quarterly* v. 40, no. 2 (2000), 161–171.
  36. Budziszewski, 64 and 70. J. Budziszewski, a political theorist at the University of Texas, challenges modernity's mutation of skepticism, arguing that ancient skeptics, for example, "did not claim that we cannot know anything at all, but only that our knowledge lacks absolute certainty." Doubt, of course, has always been a key ingredient to skepticism, but this does not mean that an individual, community, or culture was proscribed by the skeptic from "acting on whatever principles seemed on rational reflection *most likely* to be true." *Ibid.*
  37. *Ibid.*, 64–66, 234.
  38. Nederman and Laursen, 3–4.
  39. Nicholas Lash, *The Beginning and the End of Religion* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996), 240.
  40. Conyers, 243.
  41. *Ibid.*, 244.
  42. *Ibid.*, 245.
  43. John Rawls, "The Idea of an Overlapping Consensus [1987]," in *John Rawls: Collected Papers*, ed. Samuel Freeman (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1999), 424.
  44. "The Idea of Public Reason Revisited (1997)," in *John Rawls: Collected Papers*, 591.

45. Budziszewski, 234. Rawls's original position, as a constructivist political conception, is, unlike that of Kant, focused primarily on a constructivist framework for political justice rather than an encompassing moral doctrine. Such a construction, argues Rawls, makes an overlapping consensus of basic political values possible in a pluralistic, democratic society. Rawls, *Political Liberalism*, (New York: Columbia University Press, 1996), 89–90.
46. Rawls, *Political Liberalism*, 26.
47. *Ibid.*, 90.
48. *Ibid.*, 25 n. 27.
49. *Ibid.*, 24–27.
50. Rawls, “The Idea of an Overlapping Consensus,” 424–26.
51. Budziszewski, 76–77.
52. Lash, 24.
53. Donald Demarco, “Is Tolerance a Virtue?” in *Lay Witness* (November/December 2005): 14–15.
54. Sandel, 107–112.
55. *Ibid.*, 110.
56. Demarco, 14–15.
57. *Ibid.*
58. Conyers, 7–8.
59. *Ibid.*, 4.
60. Cary J. Nederman, *Worlds of Difference* (University Park, PA: The Pennsylvania State University Press, 2000), 4–5.
61. DeMarco, 15.
62. Budziszewski, 5–15. Budziszewski begins his exposition by explaining what he means by virtue: “Virtues are complex dispositions of character, deeply ingrained habits by which people call upon all of their passions and capacities in just those ways that aid, prompt, focus, inform, and execute their moral choices instead of clouding them, misleading them, or obstructing their execution.” *Ibid.*, 5.
63. *Ibid.*, 5–7.
64. *Ibid.*, 7.
65. Rushworth M. Kidder offers a similar assessment of the term “value” that provides an effective framework for distinguishing between those ideas that possess an intrinsic worth and those which help to achieve some worthy goal. Rushworth M. Kidder, *How Good People Make Tough Choices* (New York: HarperCollins, 2003), 79.
66. Conyers, 8.
67. Budziszewski, 7.
68. *Ibid.*, 13.
69. Paul Tillich, *Systematic Theology*, vol. 1 (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1951), 211.
70. Budziszewski, 224.
71. Available at <http://www.unesco.org/tolerance/declaeng.htm>. The declaration was formulated by the member states of the United Nations Educational,

- Scientific and Cultural Organization, convening in Paris at the twenty-eighth session of the General Conference in 1995.
72. See the United Nations, "A Global Quest for Tolerance," available at <http://www.unesco.org/tolerance/global.htm#introduction>.
  73. Walzer, 11.
  74. This, of course, is not to say that *concordia* was not desired. Llull, Bodin, and Las Casas all desired religious unity. However, recognizing the likelihood of lasting difference, they sought unity elsewhere. For Llull it came in the form of a common humility and search for truth, respecting the inalienability of human freedom. For Las Casas unity was located in the idea of the *imago Dei*; all of humanity is bequeathed a sacred dignity as created in God's image. For Bodin, temporal unity rested in a pragmatic fidelity to the state.
  75. National Public Radio, "Diverse Marseilles Spared in French Riots," December 10, 2005.
  76. See Daniel Williams, "Long Integrated, Marseille is Spared," *washingtonpost.com*, November 16, 2005, available at <http://www.washingtonpost.com/>.
  77. "Diverse Marseilles Spared in French Riots."
  78. *Ibid.*
  79. For instance, in 2002 a Jewish synagogue was burned in Marseille, sparking fears that anti-Semitism was reemerging in France. Moreover, the continuation of the Arab and Israeli conflict in the Middle East remains an unsettling motivation for Jewish-Muslim conflict in cities like Marseille.
  80. "Long Integrated, Marseille is Spared," *washingtonpost.com*.
  81. *Ibid.*
  82. Glenn Frankel, "Harmony Strikes a Chord with Muslims, Jews in Marseille," *washingtonpost.com*, February 21, 2004, available at <http://www.washingtonpost.com/>.
  83. NPR, "Diverse Marseilles Spared in French Riots."
  84. *Washingtonpost.com*, "Long Integrated, Marseille is Spared."
  85. *Ibid.*
  86. *Ibid.*
  87. Budziszewski, 228.
  88. Walzer, 11.
  89. Kidder, 34.
  90. "The Law of Peoples (1993)," in *John Rawls: Collected Papers*, 561–62.

## Chapter 4

1. Bernard Lewis, *Islam and the West* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1993), 181.
2. John L. Esposito, "Practice and Theory," in *Islam and the Challenge of Democracy*, ed. Joshua Cohen and Deborah Chasman (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2004), 95–96.



3. Michael Novak, *The Hunger for Universal Liberty: Why the Clash of Civilizations is not Inevitable* (New York: Basic Books, 2004), 209.
4. *Ibid.*, 208–9.
5. *Ibid.*, 209.
6. *Ibid.*
7. Mashhood Rizvi, “Intolerable Injustices,” in *The Place of Tolerance in Islam*, ed. Joshua Cohen and Ian Lague (Boston: Beacon, 2002), 70–71.
8. Martin Kramer, “Coming to Terms: Fundamentalists or Islamists?” in *The Middle East Quarterly* X (Spring 2003); available at <http://www.meforum.org/article/541/>.
9. See Noah Feldman, *After Jihad: America and the Struggle for Islamic Democracy* (New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 2003), 41–50.
10. Seyyed Hossein Nasr, *Islam: Religion, History, and Civilization* (San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco, 2003), 179–80.
11. Feldman, 42.
12. *Ibid.*
13. Natana J. Delong-Bas, *Wahhabi Islam: From Revival and Reform to Global Jihad* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2004), 17, 18.
14. *Ibid.*, 18.
15. Abou El Fadl, “The Place of Tolerance in Islam,” in *The Place of Tolerance in Islam*, 8–9.
16. Remarks from Natana J. Delong-Bas in an interview she gave through the Saudi-American Forum; available at [http://www.saudi-american-forum.org/Newsletters2004/SAF\\_Item\\_Of\\_Interest\\_WahhabiIslam1.htm](http://www.saudi-american-forum.org/Newsletters2004/SAF_Item_Of_Interest_WahhabiIslam1.htm).
17. Delong-Bas, *Wahhabi Islam*, 288–89. Delong-Bas makes an important distinction between Osama bin Laden and Islamists such as Ibn Abd al-Wahhab, (medieval scholar) Ibn Taymiyya, and Sayyid Qutb. Unlike bin Laden, these men “were highly educated scholars and jurists with a profound knowledge of the Quran, Sunna, and Islamic law. Bin Laden, in contrast, is neither a scholar nor a teacher. He is a businessman by education and profession. He lacks the scholarly credentials and moral weight to issue *fatawa* on his own, which explains why there are always several signatories on his declarations.” *Ibid.*, 275.
18. Delong-Bas, Saudi American Forum conversation.
19. Abou El Fadl, 8–9.
20. Nasr, 180.
21. *Ibid.*
22. John J. Donohue and John L. Esposito, eds., *Islam in Transition: Muslim Perspectives*, 2nd ed. (New York: Oxford University Press, 2007), 74.
23. Lenn E. Goodman, *Islamic Humanism* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003), 12.
24. Maududi, quoted in Beverly Milton-Edwards, *Islam and Politics in the Contemporary World* (Cambridge: Polity, 2004), 53. See also John Esposito, *Islam and Politics* (Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press, 1984), 147.

25. Abul A'la Maududi, "Political Theory of Islam," *The Islamic Law and Constitutions*, 6th ed., ed. Khurshid Ahmad (Lahore: Islamic Publications, 1977), 160; also in Esposito, *Islam and Politics*, 147.
26. Milton-Edwards, 54–55. See also Esposito, *Islam and Politics*, 148–49; and Youssef M. Choueiri, *Islamic Fundamentalism* (London: Pinter Publishers, 1990), 110–11.
27. Antony Black, *The History of Islamic Political Thought: From the Prophet to the Present* (New York: Routledge, 2001), 320.
28. Maududi, *Rights of Non-Muslims in the Islamic State* (Lahore: Islamic Publications, 1982), 22–23. See also Choueiri, 110–12; Noah Feldman, 22; and Black, 343–44.
29. Maududi, *First Principles of the Islamic State* (Lahore: Islamic Publications, 1983), 67. See Choueiri, 111.
30. Choueiri, 111–12.
31. *Ibid.*, 111.
32. Maududi, *First Principles of the Islamic State*, 16–65; and Choueiri, 110.
33. Among Qutb's many writings is a thirty-volume commentary on the Qur'an that has been widely studied by Muslims over the last four decades.
34. Feldman, 43. The Muslim Brotherhood was founded by Egyptian Hasan al-Banna in 1928 as a religious, educational, and socio-political order grounded on a conservative and comprehensive worldview of Islam that encompassed every aspect of life, temporal and spiritual. Its weltanschauung directly opposes that of the West. The Muslim Brotherhood became a distinct political force in 1939, directly challenging the corrupt monarchical government in Egypt in favor of a re-Islamization of society. Its influence would spread across the Middle East, arguably becoming "the single most important institutional element in the diffusion of political Islam." As some in the Muslim Brotherhood began to resort more regularly to political violence and radical policies, the organization would be forcefully suppressed and isolated by government authorities, culminating in al-Banna's assassination in 1949. *Ibid.*, 42–43.
35. In *Milestones*, Qutb states that "the chasm between Islam and *Jahiliyyah* is great, and a bridge is not to be built across it so that the people on the two sides may mix with each other, but only so that the people of *Jahiliyyah* may come over to Islam . . . If not, then we shall say to them what God commanded His Messenger—peace be upon him—to say: "For you your way, for me mine. 109:6)" Sayyid Qutb, *Milestones* (Dar Al-Ilm, Damascus, Syria, 1964), 140.
36. Feldman, 43. See also Black, 321; and Yvonne Haddad, "Sayyid Qutb: Ideologue of Islamic Revival," in *Voices of Resurgent Islam*, ed. John Esposito (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1983), 85–87. According to Youssef Choueiri, *jahiliyya* was reframed as a fundamentalist concept by Muslim Indian politicians and thinkers in the 1930s and 1940s to refer to the Hindus' non-Islamic doctrines and ideologies. Choueiri, 94–95.
37. Sayyid Qutb, *Social Justice in Islam*, trans. William E. Shepard (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1996), 303–4, 308.

38. Sayyid Qutb, quoted in Robert Worth, *New York Times*, October 13, 2001; Goodman, *Islamic Humanism*, 14.
39. Qutb, *Milestones*, 83.
40. *Ibid.*, 127. See also 130 and 131.
41. Richard P. Mitchell, *The Society of the Muslim Brothers* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1969), 245, referenced in Black, 341.
42. Ahmad Moussalli, *Radical Islamic Fundamentalism: The Ideological and Political Discourse of Sayyid Qutb* (Beirut: American University of Beirut, 1992), 162–63; quoted in Black, 341.
43. Qutb, *Social Justice in Islam*, 8.
44. Qutb, *Milestones*, 93; quoted in Haddad, 82.
45. Goodman, 15.
46. Qutb, *Social Justice*, 59–60, 66, 79, 110–11, 213–14. See also Goodman, 12–16.
47. Haddad, 84.
48. *Ibid.*
49. Qutb, *Milestones*, 57 and 76.
50. Qutb, *Social Justice in Islam*, 297, 299, 306, 329, 333–35. See also Qutb, *Milestones*, 77–92, 159–60; and Haddad, 86–87.
51. Qutb, *Milestones*, 131.
52. Goodman, 15.
53. Abou El Fadl, 11.
54. *Ibid.*
55. *Ibid.*
56. Nasr, 181.
57. Feldman, 47.
58. Abou El Fadl, 10–11.
59. *Ibid.*, 11.
60. Qur'an 9:29. Abou El Fadl, 12–13.
61. Qur'an 5:51. *Ibid.*, 11.
62. Abou El Fadl, 13.
63. Nasr, 182.
64. *Ibid.*
65. Dale F. Eickelman, "The Coming Transformation in the Muslim World," in *Current History* (January 2000), 16. Dale Eickelman is a professor of anthropology and human relations at Dartmouth College. One of his more recent works is *New Media in the Muslim World: The Emerging Public Sphere* (Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 1999).
66. Yohanan Friedmann, *Tolerance and Coercion in Islam: Interfaith Relations in the Muslim Tradition* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), 4. Friedmann acknowledges the same required admission for Christians. Furthermore, he points out that Muslims can find solace in the commonly held belief that the living standards of non-Muslims under medieval Muslim rulers, for instance, "were significantly better than those imposed on Jews and other minorities by their Christian counterparts." Bernard Lewis supports this view: "There is nothing in Islamic history to compare with the massacres and

- expulsions, the inquisitions and persecutions that Christians habitually inflicted on non-Christians and still more on each other. In the lands of Islam, persecution was the exception; in Christendom, sadly, it was the norm.” Bernard Lewis, *The Multiple Identities of the Middle East* (New York: Schocken Books, 1998), 129. See also, Abou El Fadl, *The Place of Tolerance in Islam*, 23.
67. W. Cole Durham, Jr. “Perspective on Religious Liberty: A Comparative Framework,” in *Religious Human Rights in Global Perspective: Legal Perspectives*, ed. Johan D. van der Vyver and John Witte, Jr. (Hague: Martinus Nijhoff, 1996), 13.
  68. *Ibid.*, 15.
  69. Esposito, “Practice and Theory,” 98–99.
  70. Feldman, 20.
  71. *Ibid.*
  72. *Ibid.*, 20–21.
  73. Mohammad Hashim Kamali, *Freedom, Equality, and Justice* (Cambridge: The Islamic Texts Society, 2002), 47.
  74. Ishtiaq Hussain Qureshi, *Pakistan: An Islamic Democracy* (Lahore: n.p., n.d., [1951]), 5; quoted in Sharif Al Mujahid. *Ideology of Pakistan* (Lahore: Progressive Publishers, 1974), 4; found in *Essays on Pakistan Affairs*, vol. 2 (Lahore: Progressive Publishers, 1975), series no. 21.
  75. Qur’an 2:256.
  76. Qur’an 109:6.
  77. Qur’an 5:51.
  78. This suggestion is made by Roger M. Savory, “Relations between the Safavid State and its Non-Muslim Minorities,” *Islam and Christian-Muslim Relations* 14, no. 4 (2003): 435.
  79. Abou El Fadl, 14.
  80. Qur’an 11:118–9.
  81. Qur’an 49:13; see Abou El Fadl 15–16.
  82. Abou El Fadl, 16.
  83. *Ibid.* The Ottoman and Mughal Empires would later confront sizeable non-Muslim populations with policies of systematic toleration. The idiosyncrasies underpinning their policies for coexistence will be discussed in chapter five.
  84. Abou El Fadl, 17. Qur’an 5:69, 2:62.
  85. Abou El Fadl, 18.
  86. Qur’an. 8:61. Abou El Fadl 19–20.
  87. Qur’an 2:190; see 2:193. See Abou El Fadl, 20.
  88. Abou El Fadl, 20–21. Qur’an 60:9, 4:90, 4:94, 2:194, 2:190, and 5:2. See Goodman for a meaningful discussion and exegesis of studies, texts, and scholars dealing with the historical roots and diverging nature of Islamic humanistic thought.
  89. Qur’an 2:256.
  90. William H. Brackney, ed. *Human Rights and the World’s Major Religions*, vol. 3, *The Islamic Tradition*, by Muddathir ‘Abd al-Rahim (Westport, CT: Praeger, 2005), 46. Qur’an 2:190. ‘Abd al-Rahim is a professor of Political Science and

Islamic Studies at the International Islamic University of Malaysia. He is also a charter member and Secretary General of the Sudanese National Committee for Human Rights, founded in 1967.

91. Qur'an 60:8–9. *Ibid.*
92. *Ibid.*, 46–47.
93. *Ibid.*, 47.
94. Quoted in *Ibid.*, 47.
95. Ibn 'Abd Rabbih, *al-'Iqd al-Farid*, vol. 4 (Beirut: Dar al-Kitab al-'Arabi, 1983), 247; quoted in 'Abd al-Rahim, 47–48.
96. Abū Zahrah, *al-Mujtamaa' al-Insānī fī Zill al-Islām*, 2nd ed. (Jeddah: Dār al-Ṣu'ūdiyyah, 1981), 57–58; quoted in Mohammad Hashim Kamali, *The Dignity of Man: An Islamic Perspective* (Cambridge: The Islamic Texts Society, 2002), 69.
97. These sayings were composed in the sixteenth century by Ala 'al-Din ibn Mutaqqi, "The Treasury of Workmen in Traditions and Sayings and Deeds" (*Kanz al-'Ummal fī Sunan al-Aqwal wa'l-Af'al*) and were published on the margins of the *Musnad* of Ibn Hanbal (Cairo edition); quoted in Dwight M. Donaldson, *Studies in Muslim Ethics* (London: S.P.C.K., 1953), 79. The Sunni canon of *hadith* was completed five hundred years after Muhammad's death and consists of six authentic collections of traditions: al-Bukhari (d. 870), Muslim ibn al-Hajjaj (d. 875), Ibn Maja (d. 886), Abu Dawud (d. 888), al-Tirmidhi (d. 892), al-Nisai (d. 915). Ahmed ibn Hanbal (mid-eighth century) is often included as a recognized source of traditions. The sayings above were published in the margins of Ibn Hanbal's *Musnad*. Abū Zahrah, quoted in Kamali, *The Dignity of Man*, 69.
98. Kamali, *The Dignity of Man*, 68.
99. Ibn Hanbal, *Musnad Ibn Hanbal*, vol. 5, *hadith* no. 3655. See Kamali, *The Dignity of Man*, 68. The Prophet Muhammad's condemnation of *tanattu'* is clear in his pointed repetition, "Perished are the hair-splitters, perished are the hair-splitters, perished are the hair-splitters" (*hadith* no. 1824). Quoted in *Ibid.*, 71.
100. Qur'an 7:199.
101. Qur'an 42:43.
102. Kamali, *The Dignity of Man*, 69.
103. Donaldson, 67–68. For most Shi'i, the *sunna* represents the deeds, sayings, and approvals of Muhammad, as well as the divinely ordained Imams who are believed to have also received divinely inspired revelations. Shi'i believe these Imams were appointed by God to follow Muhammad and to lead mankind in the Islamic way of life.
104. Muhammad Amin, *Sayings of the Prophet Muhammad* (Lahore: Muhammad Ashraf, n.d.); quoted in Dwight M. Donaldson, 70.
105. Kamali, *The Dignity of Man*, 72.
106. Black, 57.
107. Paul Kurtz, "Free Inquiry and Islamic Philosophy: The Significance of George Hourani," in *Averroës and the Enlightenment*, ed. Mourad Wahba and Mona

- Abousenna (Amherst, NY: Prometheus Books, 1996), 234. See also George F. Hourani, *Reason and Tradition in Islamic Ethics* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1985), 9–14.
108. Hourani, *Reason and Tradition in Islamic Ethics*, 6.
  109. Ibid.
  110. Black, 58.
  111. Ibid., 58–60.
  112. Ibid., 58.
  113. Kurtz, 240–41.
  114. Black, 59–60; George Hourani, *On the Harmony between Religion and Philosophy* (London: Luzak & Co., 1967).
  115. Ibid., 59.
  116. Kurtz, 239.
  117. Black, 63.
  118. Abdolkarim Souroush, *Treatise on Tolerance* trans. Nilou Mobasser, (Praemium Erasmian Foundation, 2004), 1.
  119. Ibid.
  120. Ibid., 2.
  121. Ibid., 3–5.
  122. Ibid., 6.
  123. Abou El Fadl, *The Place of Tolerance in Islam*, 13–23.
  124. *Treatise on Tolerance*, 6.
  125. *Treatise on Tolerance*, 7.
  126. Goodman, 23.

## Chapter 5

1. Vali Nasr, *The Shia Revival: How Conflicts within Islam will Shape the Future* (New York: W. W. Norton, 2006), 24.
2. Ibid., 20, 22.
3. See, for instance, Roger M. Savory, “Relations between the Safavid State and its Non-Muslim Minorities,” *Islam and Christian-Muslim Relations* 14, no.4 (2003): 435; William H. Brackney, ed. *Human Rights and the World’s Major Religions*, vol. 3, *The Islamic Tradition*, by Muddathir ‘Abd al-Rahim (Westport, CT: Praeger, 2005), 52–60.
4. C. L. Cahen, “Dhimma,” in *The Encyclopedia of Islam*, ed. Bernard Lewis and J. Schacht (Leiden, Netherlands: E. J. Brill, 1983), 227.
5. See Bruce Masters, *Christians and Jews in the Ottoman Arab World: The Roots of Sectarianism* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001), 21; Cahen, 227. The origin of the “Pact of Umar” is disputed. Perhaps most in Western academe would agree that the Umayyad caliph, Umar II (717–20), was the creator of the first edict of tolerance. Bruce Masters seeks to mediate any uncertainty surrounding its official origins, arguing that the “final formulation” was

- likely “a composite of many different agreements between Muslims and non-Muslims.” *Ibid.*
6. Noel J. Coulson, *A History of Islamic Law* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1964), 27; Savoy, 435.
  7. See Masters, 22; See also Savoy, 435–36; Cahen, 227; Jane I. Smith, “Islam and Christendom: Historical, Cultural, and Religious Interactions from the Seventh to the Fifteenth Centuries,” in *The Oxford History of Islam*, ed. John L. Esposito (New York: Oxford University Press, 1999), 308; and *Islam from the Prophet Muhammad to the Capture of Constantinople*, vol. 2 of *Religion and Society*, ed. and trans. Bernard Lewis (New York: 1974), 216–23.
  8. See Cahen, 227–31; and Masters, 16–40.
  9. See Savoy for a brief discussion of the *ahl al-dhimma*. A concise overview of the legal nature of *dhimma* is provided by Chafik Chehata, “Dhimma,” in *The Encyclopedia of Islam*, 231; C. L. Cahen, “Dhimma,” in *The Encyclopedia of Islam*, 227–31; Benjamin Braude and Bernard Lewis eds., *Christians and Jews in the Ottoman Empire*, 2 vols. (New York: Holmes & Meier, 1982); and Masters, 16–40.
  10. Jane I. Smith, 308–9. The concept of *dhimma* was interpreted in a more exacting sense mainly by judges and jurists of Islam, while in a more contextual sense by various regional rulers and administrators. The legal schools differed on the level of religious tolerance to afford non-Muslims. While Christians did serve important posts throughout the Islamic empire—court physicians, architects, engineers, translators, philosophers, and civil administrators—they were, at the same time, prohibited from, inter alia, living in Mecca or Medina, giving testimony about a Muslim in legal courts, marrying a Muslim, or building new churches or repairing old ones in towns where Muslims lived. *Ibid.*, 308.
  11. Masters, 24.
  12. See Cahen, 230, for a brief comparison of historical tolerance and intolerance between Christian and Muslims. See also Masters, 21–23.
  13. Masters, 29, 33, 35–39.
  14. *Ibid.*, 29.
  15. *Ibid.*
  16. *Ibid.*, 39.
  17. *Ibid.*
  18. *Ibid.*, 29.
  19. *Ibid.*, 40.
  20. Michael Walzer, *On Toleration* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1997), 14.
  21. Niyazi Berkes, *The Development of Secularism in Turkey* (Montreal: McGill University Press, 1964), 11.
  22. *Ibid.*, 11–12.
  23. Bernard Lewis, *Cultures in Conflict: Christians, Muslims, and Jews in the Age of Discovery* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995), 16. For a thorough historical study on the Ottoman system of tolerance see Bernard Lewis, *The Jews of*

- Islam* (New Haven, CT: Princeton University Press, 1984), 3–66; Benjamin Braude and Bernard Lewis, eds, *Christians and Jews in the Ottoman Empire: The Functioning of a Plural Society*; Bruce Masters, *Christians and Jews in the Ottoman Arab World: The Roots of Sectarianism*.
24. While equal to each other, Walzer explains how prominent non-Muslim communities were all “subject to the same restrictions vis-à-vis Muslims—with regard to dress, proselytizing, and intermarriage, for example.” What is more, these communities were given “the same legal control over their own members,” and, significantly, the level of religious and social freedom the Ottomans extended to the various *millet*s was generally greater than that shown by the various communities to their individual members. Walzer, 18.
  25. *Ibid.*
  26. Richard Tapper, ed., *Islam in Modern Turkey: Religion, Politics and Literature in a Secular State* (New York: I. B. Tauris, 1991), 4; Ayse Kadioglu, “Republican Epistemology and Islamic Discourses in Turkey in the 1990s,” *Muslim World* 88 (January 1998): 5.
  27. Berkes, 221.
  28. Kadioglu, 4.
  29. *Ibid.*
  30. *Ibid.*, 5. The issue of religious inequality by the state was a critical item that the Western powers required a resolution to before rapprochement with the Ottoman state could occur. England, France, Austria, and the Ottomans formed a commission to construct the Reform Edict of 1856. *Ibid.*
  31. Tapper, 5.
  32. Kadioglu, 2.
  33. Tapper, 5–6.
  34. *Ibid.*
  35. Kevin Boyle and Juliet Sheen, *Freedom of Religion and Belief: World Report* (London: Routledge, 1997), 388.
  36. Bernard Lewis, *The Emergence of Modern Turkey* (London: Oxford University Press, 1968), 404. Of course, secularism would not be officially incorporated into the Constitution until 1937. See Berkes, 482.
  37. Berkes, 481–82.
  38. Tapper, 7.
  39. In addition to Kemalists, for example, the approximately twelve million Alevi, a Shi’i minority in Turkey, have purposefully embraced, in fidelity to their Islamic beliefs, the Turkish Republic’s secularism as a necessary safeguard against the religious persecution from the Sunni majority. See David Shankland, *The Alevi in Turkey: The Emergence of a Secular Islamic Tradition* (London: RoutledgeCurzon, 2003), 17; For insightful works on the Alevi see Shankland’s, *The Alevi in Turkey*; İlhan Ataseven, *The Alevi-Bektasi Legacy: Problems of Acquisition and Explanation* (Stockholm: Almqvist and Wil International, 1997); Tord Olson, Catharina Raudvere, and Elisabeth Özdalga, eds., *Alevi Identity: Cultural, Religious, and Social Perspectives* (London: Taylor and Francis, 1998).



40. See Tapper, 7–8. Kadioglu writes of how Kemalism’s attempts to “marginalize” and direct Islamic institutions failed to disengage Islam from the public realm and, instead, made a way for its politicization. Kadioglu, 13.
41. Turkey continues to struggle with an ethnic intolerance and violence that culminated, in large part, with the transition towards nationalism and the desire for a Turkish identity. The sizeable Kurdish minority, for example, has faced persecution and intolerance because of their desire for cultural autonomy and the perceived threat they pose to national solidarity. Even though the Kurdish community is part of the majority Muslim population, its apparent refusal to accept its “Turkishness” has led to greater inequality, a general ethnic intolerance, and, in many cases, a forced assimilation. Turkey, then, is in essence an “ethnocracy” that “precludes any ethnonational differentiation within its borders.” Thus, although it demonstrates a significant degree of religious tolerance, it has not yet demonstrated an acceptable tolerance to those who are seen as a threat to the “sacred” Turkish identity of the secular state. Nils A. Butenshon, “State, Power, and Citizenship in the Middle East: A Theoretical Introduction,” in *Citizenship and the State in the Middle East: Approaches and Applications*, ed. Nils A. Butenshon, Uri Davis, and Manuel Hassassian (Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press, 2000), 19–20.
42. Kadioglu, 13, 17. See also Michael Meeker, “The New Muslim Intellectuals in the Republic of Turkey,” in *Islam in Modern Turkey: Religion, Politics and Literature in a Secular State*, ed. Richard Tapper (New York: I. B. Tauris, 1991), 189–219.
43. Meeker, 200. Meeker makes this observation in his analysis of a particular Muslim intellectual’s work, that of Ali Bulac.
44. See Kadioglu, 13, 17–18.
45. Ahmet T. Kuru, “Search for a Middle Way,” in *Turkish Islam and the Secular State: The Gülen Movement*, ed. M. Hakan Yavuz and John L. Esposito (Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press, 2003), 119.
46. Kadioglu, 18.
47. Kuru, 117.
48. Fethullah Gülen, *Prophet Muhammad: The Infinite Light* (London: Truestar, 1995), 200–201; quoted in Ahmet T. Kuru, 117.
49. Fethullah Gülen, “The Two Roses of the Emerald Hills: Tolerance and Dialogue,” available at <http://www.fgulen.com/>.
50. Qur’an 64:14.
51. Qur’an 45:14.
52. Gülen, “The Two Roses of the Emerald Hills.”
53. Fethullah Gülen, “Tolerance in the Life of the Individual and Society,” Speech recorded on January 13, 1996, available at <http://www.fgulen.com/>.
54. Fethullah Gülen, “Tolerance,” in *The Thoughts of Growing to Yield Fruit* (Kaynak, Izmir, 1996), 1922. Article is available at <http://enfugulen.net> (accessed August 30, 2007).
55. Gülen, “Tolerance in the Life of the Individual and Society.”

56. Marvin Howe, *Turkey Today: A Nation Divided over Islam's Revival* (Boulder, CO: Westview, 2000), 47. Howe suggests that religious violence in Turkey is due in part to living in a "dangerous neighborhood" and experiencing a "spillover of violence" from more intolerant neighbors like Iran and Iraq. *Ibid.*
57. Ozay Mehmet, *Islamic Identity and Development: Studies of the Islamic Periphery* (London: Routledge, 1990), 69. It was Muhammad's Medina Contract that "made possible [in the seventh century] the livelihood of various groups with different religious convictions, secularists, and atheists in political unity." Kadioglu, 16.
58. Lenn E. Goodman, *Islamic Humanism* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003), 28. Goodman makes this important observation, suggesting a dynamic equilibrium as the ultimate goal.
59. Mehmet, 21.
60. A sizeable portion of this section on Pakistan is discussed in the *UCLA Journal of Islamic and Near Eastern Law*. Aaron Tyler, "Administering a Sacred Trust: The Place of Religious Tolerance in the State of Pakistan," *UCLA Journal of Islamic and Near Eastern Law* 5, no. 1.
61. Mahmood Monshipouri, "Reform and the Human Rights Quandary: Islamists vs. Secularists," *Journal of Church and State* 41, no. 3 (1999): 460–61.
62. Amnesty International 2004 Report, available at <http://www.amnesty.org/report2004/>. See also Freedom House's Center for Religious Freedom, available at <http://www.freedomhouse.org/religion/>; and the "International Religious Freedom Report 2006," released by the U.S. Department of State, available at <http://www.state.gov/>.
63. See, for instance, the U.S. Department of State's *International Religious Freedom Report* for 2005 and 2006.
64. Available at [http://www.muhammadanism.org/Government/Government\\_Pakistan\\_Blasphemy.htm](http://www.muhammadanism.org/Government/Government_Pakistan_Blasphemy.htm).
65. See Freedom House, *Country Report: 2006; International Religious Freedom Report* for 2006.
66. *International Religious Freedom Report* for 2006.
67. Constitution of Pakistan. See also Y. V. Gankovsky and V. N. Moskalenko, *The Three Constitutions of Pakistan* (Lahore: People's Publishing House, 1978).
68. Sharif Al-Mujahid, *Ideology of Pakistan* (Lahore: Progressive Publishers, 1974), 4; found in *Essays on Pakistan Affairs*, vol. 2 (Lahore: Progressive Publishers, 1975), series no. 21.
69. *Ibid.*, 4–5.
70. John F. Richards, *The New Cambridge History of India: The Mughal Empire* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1993), 2; See also, Al Mujahid, 5.
71. Al-Mujahid, 5–6.
72. Antony Black, *The History of Islamic Political Thought: From the Prophet to the Present* (New York: Routledge, 2001), 239.
73. *Ibid.*
74. *Ibid.*

75. N. C. Mehta, "An Unpublished Testament of Babur," *The Twentieth Century* (January 1936): 340; quoted in Black, 239–40.
76. Black, 240.
77. Black, 242; and Richards, 38.
78. Richards, 39; and Black, 243.
79. Black, 243.
80. See, for instance, Black 239–46; M. D. Arshad, "The Mughal Period," in *An Advanced History of Muslim Rule in Indo-Pakistan* (Dacca: Rashida Akhter, 1967), 54–55; and S. M. Ikram, *Muslim Civilization in India* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1964), 145.
81. Black, 240.
82. Arshad, 50.
83. Ibid.
84. Black, 248.
85. Rizvi, 364; quoted in Black, 248.
86. Black, 248.
87. Eugenia Vanina, *Ideas and Society in India from the Sixteenth to the Eighteenth Centuries* (Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1996), 34, quoted in Black, 241.
88. Arshad, 54.
89. See Black, 246; and Arshad, 58. For a thorough study of Islam and the Mughals see M. D. Arshad, *An Advanced History of Muslim Rule in Indo-Pakistan* (Dacca: Rashida Akhter, 1967); and A. A. Rizvi, *The Religious and Intellectual History of Muslims in Akbar's Reign with Special Reference to Abu'l Fadl (1556–1605)* (New Delhi: M. Manoharlal, 1975).
90. Black, 249; and Richards, 172, 175–77.
91. Richards, 297.
92. Noah Feldman, *After Jihad: American and the Struggle for Islamic Democracy* (New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 2003), 120.
93. Ibid., 120; See also Michael Walzer, 15.
94. Muhammad Iqbal, "A New Altar," in *Poems from Iqbal* (London: John Murray, 1955), 8–9, interpreted in Ronald W. Neufeldt, "Islam and India: The Views of Muhammad Iqbal," in *Muslim World* (July–October 1981): 182.
95. Neufeldt, "Islam and India," 183.
96. Syed Abdul Wahid, *Thoughts and Reflections of Iqbal* (Lahore: Sh. Muhammad Ashraf, 1964), 54, quoted in Neufeldt, "Islam and India," 183.
97. Ronald W. Neufeldt, "Religion and Politics in the Thought of Muhammad Iqbal," *Journal of Religious Thought* 34, no. 1 (1977): 35–39; Neufeldt, "Islam and India," 183, 186.
98. Wahid, 54, 100–101; Neufeldt, "Islam and India," 185.
99. Sir Mohammad Iqbal, *The Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam* (Lahore: Ashraf, reprinted 1960), 154.
100. Iqbal, 147.
101. Ibid., 156.
102. B. A. Dar, ed., *Letters and Writings of Iqbal* (Karachi: Iqbal Academy, 1967), 55, 70, quoted in Neufeldt, "Islam and India," 187.

103. Wahid, 197; Neufeldt, "Islam and India," 187; L. R. Gordon-Polonskaya, "Ideology of Muslim Nationalism," in *Iqbal: Poet-Philosopher of Pakistan*, ed. Hafeez Malik (New York: Columbia University Press, 1971), 134.
104. Neufeldt, "Islam and India," 188.
105. Ibid.
106. Wahid, 100–101; Neufeldt, "Islam and India," 184–85.
107. L. R. Gordon-Polonskaya, "Ideology of Muslim Nationalism," in *Iqbal: Poet-Philosopher of Pakistan*, ed. Hafeez Malik (New York: Columbia University Press, 1971), 134.
108. Annemarie Schimmel, *Gabriel's Wing: A Study into the Religious Ideas of Sir Muhammad Iqbal* (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1963), 111.
109. Wahid, 261; See also Neufeldt, "Islam and India," 191.
110. Gordon-Polonskaya, 135.
111. Quoted in Rajmohan Gandhi, *Eight Lives: a Study of the Hindu-Muslim Encounter* (New York: State University of New York Press, 1986), 78.
112. Javie Iqbal, "Iqbal: My Father," in *Iqbal: Poet-Philosopher of Pakistan*, ed. Hafeez Malik (New York: Columbia University Press, 1971), 64.
113. Stephen Phillip Cohen, "The Nation and the State of Pakistan," *Washington Quarterly* 25 (Summer 2002): 110.
114. Ibid., 110–11.
115. Gandhi, 160.
116. Allen Hayes Merriem, *Gandhi vs Jinnah: The Debate over the Partition of India* (Calcutta: Minerva, 1980), 91–92; quoted in Gandhi, 160.
117. Eid Day broadcast, November 13, 1939, quoted in C. M. Naim, ed., *Iqbal, Jinnah, and Pakistan* (Syracuse: Syracuse University, 1979), 101; quoted in Gandhi, 185.
118. Afzal Iqbal, *Islamisation of Pakistan* (Delhi, Mohammed Ahmad for Idarah-I Adabiyat-I Delli, 1984), 38–40.
119. Jamil-ud-Din Ahmad, *Speeches and Writings of Mr. M. A. Jinnah* (Lahore, 1964), 463, quoted in Afzal Iqbal, 37.
120. Gandhi, 180.
121. Cohen, 111.
122. Gandhi, 128–29.
123. Anwar Hussein Syed, *Pakistan: Islam, Politics, and National Solidarity* (New York: Pacer, 1982), 59–61. See also, Afzal Iqbal, 38–41; Gandhi, 47–186.
124. Black, 320.
125. Mehmet, 66–67; and Black, 301–5, 320.
126. Eqbal Ahmed, "Religion in Politics," *Dawn* (January 31, 1991).
127. Ibid.
128. "Politics by Other Means," *The Economist* (July 21–27, 2007): 40.
129. "Musharraf Vows War on Militants," *BBC News*, July 12, 2007, available at <http://www.bbcnews.com/>.
130. John Esposito, *Islam: The Straight Path* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005), 34.
131. Ibid.

132. Walzer, 15.
133. *Ibid.*, 16.
134. Black, 248.
135. *Ibid.*
136. Mehmet, 66–67.
137. Esposito, *Islam: The Straight Path*, 82–83.
138. Walzer, 5–6.

## Chapter 6

1. The quotations and references in this paragraph were acquired from the “European Press Review,” *BBC News*, available at <http://www.bbcnews.com/>.
2. “In quotes: Reaction to Cartoons”; and “World Figures Deplore Cartoon Row,” *BBC News*, available at <http://www.bbcnews.com/>.
3. Several people were killed in Afghanistan, Somalia, Lebanon, and elsewhere as a result of violent protests. The Danish embassy in Syria was attacked. A mob in Beirut torched the Danish embassy and ransacked a Christian community in response to the cartoon publications. Protestors in Tehran broke windows of the Austrian embassy, businesses in Indian-administered Kashmir went on strike to protest, and, in Indonesia, authorities fired warning shots at rioters around the U.S. and Danish consulates in the country’s second largest city, Surabaya. While the response by Muslims in France has been subdued, French Foreign Minister Philippe Douste-Blazy reprehended the violent rioting and protests: “I am totally shocked and find it unacceptable that because there have been caricatures in the West, extremists can burn flags or take fundamentalist or extremist positions which would prove the cartoonists right.” Caroline Wyatt, “Cartoon Row Rattles France,” *BBC News* (February 3, 2006), available at <http://www.bbcnews.com/>.
4. The quotations and references in this paragraph were acquired from “Arab Press Review” and “In Quotes: Reaction to Cartoons,” *BBC News*, available at <http://www.bbcnews.com/>. *BBC News* offers a thorough collection of world opinions and press quotations surrounding the global donnybrook that occurred.
5. Philip Kennicott, “Clash over Cartoon is Caricature of Civilization,” *Washington Post* (February 4, 2006), available at <http://www.washingtonpost.com/> (accessed February 7, 2006).
6. Karen Armstrong is a leading British commentator in the area of religious affairs and has written a number of books discussing Christian, Jewish, and Muslim relations and distinctives. Quote was taken from a commentary she gave to *BBC News*, available at <http://www.bbcnews.com/>.
7. Khaled Abou El Fadl, “The Culture of Ugliness in Modern Islam and Reengaging Morality,” *UCLA Journal of Islamic and Near Eastern Law* 2, no. 1 (2002/2003): 38.
8. *Ibid.*

9. Michael Walzer states that “peaceful coexistence . . . is always a good thing . . . The sign of its goodness is that individuals and regimes are so strongly inclined to say that they value it: they can’t justify themselves, to themselves or to one another, without endorsing the value of peaceful coexistence.” From a moral perspective, he argues, the “burden of argument falls on those who would reject” the ethical impetus to peacefully coexist. Michael Walzer, *On Toleration* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1997), 2.
10. Bernard Lewis, *Islam and the West* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1993), 7–8.
11. Antony Black, *The History of Islamic Political Thought: From the Prophet to the Present* (New York: Routledge, 2001), 239.
12. Bartolomé de Las Casas, *The Only Way*, trans. Francis Patrick Sullivan, S.J., ed. Helen Rand Parish (Mahwah, NJ: Paulist, 1992), 96.
13. Lactantius, *Divine Institutes*, trans. Anthony Bowen and Peter Garnsey (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 2003), 5.19.23.
14. Qur’an, 2:256.
15. Khaled Abou El Fadl, “The Place of Tolerance in Islam,” in *The Place of Tolerance in Islam*, ed. Joshua Cohen and Ian Lague (Boston: Beacon, 2002), 18.
16. A. A. Rizvi, *The Religious and Intellectual History of Muslims in Akbar’s Reign with special reference to Abu’l Fadl (1556–1605)* (New Delhi: M. Manoharlal, 1975), 364.
17. Abou El Fadl, “The Place of Tolerance in Islam,” 110.
18. Quoted in Dwight M. Donaldson, *Studies in Muslim Ethics* (London: S.P.C.K., 1953), 79.
19. N. C. Mehta, “An Unpublished Testament of Babur,” *The Twentieth Century* (January 1936): 340; quoted in Black, 240.
20. See Muhammad Amin, *Sayings of the Prophet Muhammad* (Lahore: Muhammad Ashraf, n.d.); quoted in Dwight M. Donaldson, 70.
21. Cary J. Nederman, *Worlds of Difference: European Discourses of Toleration c. 1100–c. 1500* (University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2000), 36.
22. J. Budziszewski, *True Tolerance: Liberalism and the Necessity of Judgment* (New Brunswick, NJ: Transaction, 2000), 9.
23. Quoted in Rajmohan Gandhi, *Eight Lives: A Study of the Hindu-Muslim Encounter* (New York: State University of New York Press, 1986), 78.
24. Vaclav Havel, Liberty Medal acceptance speech, July 4, 1994, available at <http://www.constitutioncenter.org/libertymedal/Recipients/1994.asp>.
25. Nederman, 10.
26. John Christian Laursen and Cary J. Nederman, eds., *Beyond the Persecuting Society: Religious Toleration Before the Enlightenment* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1998), 8.
27. Budziszewski, 9.
28. Abou El-Fad, “The Place of Tolerance in Islam,” 18. As well, chapter four discussed the Qur’an’s teaching on how a firmness of character is achieved when

- one chooses endurance and forgiveness as the best response to being maligned by the nonmalevolent ignorance of the Other. Chapter four quotes several passages from the Qur'an, including: "The wronged one who endures with fortitude and forgiveness indeed achieves a matter of high resolve" (42:44); and "Take to forgiveness, enjoin good, and turn away from the ignorant" (7:199).
29. See, for instance, see Michael Sandel, "Judgmental Toleration," in *Natural Law, Liberalism, and Morality: Contemporary Essays*, ed. Robert George (New York: Oxford University Press, 1996), 107–12.
  30. Budziszewski, 7.
  31. Fethullah Güllen, "Tolerance in the Life of the Individual and Society," Speech recorded on January 13, 1996, available at <http://www.fgulen.com/> (accessed August 25, 2005).
  32. Syed Abdul, *Thoughts and Reflections of Iqbal* (Lahore: Sh. Muhammad Ashraf, 1965), 261, quoted in Ronald W. Neufeldt, "Islam and India: The Views of Muhammad Iqbal," *Muslim World* (July–October 1981): 191.
  33. Las Casas, *The Only Way*, 122.
  34. It is, of course, imperative to establish mutually accepted limitations for this cross-cultural understanding of tolerance. This symmetrical conception does not advocate an unfettered acceptance of the Other. Those who advocate violent intolerance toward others within and outside of a community only exacerbate the potential for conflict and threaten coexistence. Thus, this tempered, opinion-laden conception of tolerance must have transparent parameters that allow communities and civilizations to confront and even forestall those rogue and belligerent members of society who violently rebuff cross-cultural efforts toward achieving coexistence.
  35. Seyyed Hossein Nasr, "Metaphysical Roots of Tolerance and Intolerance: An Islamic Interpretation," in *Philosophy, Religion, and the Question of Intolerance*, ed. Mehdi Amin Razavi and David Ambuel (Albany, NY: State University of New York, 1997), 49–55.
  36. *Ibid.*, 55.
  37. John Christian Laursen, "Orientation: Clarifying the Conceptual Issues," in *Religious Toleration: "The Variety of Rites" from Cyrus to Defoe*, ed. John Christian Laursen (New York: St. Martin's, 1999), 6.
  38. *Ibid.*, 56.
  39. Matt Prodder, "Sebs Block Kosovo Bridge Opening," *BBC News*, available at <http://www.bbcnews.com/>.
  40. A. J. Conyers, *The Long Truce* (Dallas: Spence Publishing, 2001), 8.
  41. Nasr, "An Islamic Interpretation," 55.
  42. Martin E. Marty, *When Faiths Collide* (Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2005), 6. This project disagrees, in part, with Marty's thesis that we must move beyond tolerance and "begin to effect change by risking hospitality toward the other." This project agrees that hospitality, among a host of important virtues, must be cultivated towards the Other. However, my thesis contends that important virtues, such as charity, liberty, justice, and hospitality, are vital goals best

affected by a transcultural strategy of tolerance. A community or individual is able to “welcome a stranger” or risk hospitality toward the Other only when they are first able to tolerate those beliefs and rituals of the Other that they believe are inferior or even offensive to their own. One is reminded of the Christian adage, “hate the sin, but love the sinner.”

43. Mohamed Talbi, “Possibilities and Conditions for a Better Understanding between Islam and the West,” *Journal of Ecumenical Studies* 25, no. 2 (1988), 189.



# Bibliography

## Selected General Works

- Abou El Fadl, Khaled. *The Great Theft: Wrestling Islam from the Extremists*. New York: HarperCollins, 2005.
- Ahmed, Akbar S. *Postmodernism and Islam: Predicament and Promise*. New York: Routledge, 1992.
- . *Journey into Islam: The Crisis of Globalization*. Washington, DC: Brookings Institution, 2007.
- Barber, Benjamin. *Jihad vs. McWorld: How Globalism and Tribalism are Reshaping the World*. New York: Times Books, 1995.
- Brackney, William H., ed. *Human Rights and the World's Major Religions*. 4 Vols. Westport, CT: Praeger, 2005.
- Chapman, Colin. *Islam and the West: Conflict, Coexistence or Conversion?* Waynesboro, GA: Paternoster, 1998.
- Davis, Derek H., and Gerhard Beisier, eds. *International Perspectives on Freedom and Equality of Religious Belief*. Waco, TX: Baylor University Press, 2002.
- Delong-Bas, Natana J. *Wahhabi Islam: From Revival and Reform to Global Jihad*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2004.
- Ellens, Harold J., ed. *The Destructive Power of Religion: Violence in Judaism, Christianity, and Islam*. 4 Vols. Westport, CT: Praeger, 2004.
- Esposito, John. *Islam: The Straight Path*, 3rd. ed. New York: Oxford University Press, 2005.
- Euben, Roxanne L. *Enemy in the Mirror: Islamic Fundamentalism and the Limits of Modern Rationalism*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1999.
- Feldman, Noah. *After Jihad: America and the Struggle for Islamic Democracy*. New York: Farrar, Strauss, and Giroux, 2003.
- Fukuyama, Francis. *The End of History and the Last Man*. New York: Free Press, 1992.
- Hadda, Z. Y., ed. *Muslims in the West: From Sojourners to Citizens*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002.
- Halliday, Fred. *Islam and the Myth of Confrontation*. New York: I. B. Tauris, 1999.
- Hunter, Shireen. *The Future of Islam and the West: Clash of Civilizations or Peaceful Coexistence*. Westport, CT: Praeger, 1998.
- Huntington, Samuel P. *The Clash of Civilizations and the Remaking of World Order*. New York: Touchstone, 1997.
- Ibrahim, Anwar. *The Need for Civilizational Dialogue*. Washington, DC: Center for Muslim-Christian Understanding, Georgetown University, 1995.

- Jargy, Simon. *Islam et Chrétienté*. Geneva: Labor et Fides, 1981.
- Jenkins, Philip. *The Next Christendom: The Coming of Global Christianity*. Second Edition. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007.
- Jerichow, Anders, and Jørgen Baek Simonsen. *Islam in a Changing World: Europe and the Middle East*. Richmond, Surrey: Curzon, 1997.
- Khawaja, Mahboob A. *Muslims and the West: Quest for "Change" and Conflict Resolution*. Lanham, MD: University Press of America, 2000.
- Küng, Hans, J. van Ess, and H. Bechert. *Christianity and World Religions: Paths to Dialogue*. Translated by P. Heinegg. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis, 1993.
- Lewis, Bernard. *Islam and the West*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1993.
- . *Cultures in Conflict: Christians, Muslims, and Jews in the Age of Discovery*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995.
- Little, David, John Kelsay, and Abdulaziz A. Sachedina. *Human Rights and the Conflict of Cultures: Western and Islamic Perspectives on Religious Liberty*. Columbia, SC: University of South Carolina Press, 1988.
- Marty, Martin. *When Faiths Collide*. Oxford: Blackwell, 2005.
- Milton-Edwards, Beverly. *Islam and Politics in the Contemporary World*. Cambridge: Polity, 2004.
- Mohammadi, Ali, ed. *Islam Encountering Globalization*. London: RoutledgeCurzon, 2002.
- Nasr, Seyyed Hossein. *Islam: Religion, History, and Civilization*. San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco, 2003.
- Nielsen, Jorgen S., ed. *The Christian-Muslim Frontier: Chaos, Clash or Dialogue*. New York: I. B. Tauris, 1998.
- Novak, Michael. *The Universal Hunger for Liberty: Why the Clash of Civilizations is not Inevitable*. New York: Basic Books, 2004.
- Parel, Anthony J. and Ronald C. Keith, eds. *Comparative Political Philosophy: Studies under the Upas Tree*. Oxford: Lexington, 2003.
- Roy, Oliver. *Globalized Islam: The Search for a New Ummah*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2004.
- Sardar, Zia. *Postmodernism and the Other: The New Imperialism of Western Culture*. London: Pluto, 1998.
- Senghaas, Dieter. *The Clash within Civilizations: Coming to Terms with Cultural Conflicts*. London: Routledge, 2001.
- Shayegan, Daryush. *Cultural Schizophrenia: Islamic Societies Confronting the West*. Translated by John Howe. Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press, 1997.
- Van der Vyver, Johan D., and John Witte Jr., eds. *Religious Human Rights in Global Perspective: Legal Perspectives*. Boston: Martinus Nijhoff, 1996.
- Witte, John, Jr., and Johan D. van der Vyver, eds. *Religious Human Rights in Global Perspective: Religious Perspectives*. Boston: Martinus Nijhoff, 1996.

### Selected General Articles

- Arkoun, Mohammed. "Is Islam Threatened by Christianity?" *Cross Currents* 45, no. 4 (1995/1996): 469–79.

- Barber, Benjamin. "Beyond Jihad vs. McWorld." *The Nation*, January 21, 2002, 11–18.
- Dallmayr, Fred. "Beyond Monologue: For a Comparative Political Theory." *Perspectives on Politics* 2, no. 2 (2004): 249–57.
- Huntington, Samuel P. "If Not Civilizations, What? Paradigms of the Post-Cold War." *Foreign Affairs* 72, no. 5 (1993): 186–94.
- . "The West: Unique, Not Universal." *Foreign Affairs* 75, no. 6 (1996): 28–46.
- Kurtz, Stanley. "The Future of History." *Policy Review* 113 (June/July 2002): 43–58.
- Talbi, Mohamed. "Possibilities and Conditions for a Better Understanding between Islam and the West." *Journal of Ecumenical Studies* 25, no. 2 (1988): 161–93.

### Select Works on Religious Tolerance

- Hammann, Louis J. and Harry M. Buck, eds. *Religious Traditions and the Limits of Tolerance*. Chambersburg, PA: Anima Books, 1988.
- Laurson, John C., ed. *Religious Toleration: "The Variety of Rites" From Cyrus to Defoe*. New York: St. Martin's, 1999.
- Makdisi, George, Dominique Sourdel, and Janine Sourdel-Thomine, eds. *La Notion de Liberté au Moyen Age Islam, Byzance, Occident*. Paris: "Les Belles Lettres," 1985.
- Mensching, Gustav. *Tolerance and Truth in Religion*. Translated by H. J. Klimkeit. Tuscaloosa, AL: University of Alabama Press, 1971.
- Razavi, Mehdi Amin and David Ambuel, eds. *Philosophy, Religion, and the Question of Intolerance*. Albany, NY: State University of New York, 1997.
- Walzer, Michael. *On Toleration*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1997.
- Wolff, Robert P., Barrington Moore, and Herbert Marcuse. *A Critique of Pure Tolerance*. Boston: Beacon, 1965.

### Tolerance and Western Civilization

#### Books

- Abelard, Peter. *Dialogue of a Philosopher with a Jew and a Christian*. Translated by Pierre J. Payer. Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Medieval Studies, 1979.
- Abulafia, Anna Sapir. *Christians and Jews in the Twelfth-Century Renaissance*. London: Routledge, 1995.
- Bainton, Roland. *The Travail of Religious Liberty*. Philadelphia: Westminster, 1951.
- . "Sebastian Castellio and the Toleration Controversy of the Sixteenth Century." In *Persecution and Liberty: Essays in Honor of George Lincoln Burr*. New York: Books for Libraries, 1931.
- Bodin, Jean. *Colloquium of the Seven about Secrets of the Sublime*. Translated by Marion Leathers and Daniels Kuntz. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1975.

- Brown, Wendy. *Regulating Aversion: Tolerance in the Age of Identity and Empire*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2006.
- Budziszewski, J. *True Tolerance*. New Brunswick, NJ: Transaction, 2000.
- Butler, C. J. "Covenant Theology and the Development of Religious Liberty." In *The Covenant Connection*, edited by Daniel J. Elazer and John Kincaid. Lanham, MD: Lexington, 2000.
- Castellio, Sebastian. *Advice to a Desolate France*. Translated by Wouter Valkhoff. Edited by Marius F. Valkhoff. Shepherdstown, WV: Patmos, 1975.
- . *Concerning Heretics*. Translated by R. H. Bainton. New York: Octagon, 1965.
- Conyers, A. J. *The Long Truce*. Dallas: Spence, 2001.
- Creppell, Ingrid. *Toleration and Identity: Foundations in Early Modern Thought*. New York: Routledge, 2003.
- Fichtenau, Heinrich. *Heretics and Scholars in the High Middle Ages, 1000–12000*. Translated by Denise A. Kaiser. University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1998.
- Fubini, Riccardo. *Humanism and Secularization from Petrarch to Valla*. Durham: Duke University Press, 2003.
- Gervers, Michael, and James M. Powell, eds. *Tolerance and Intolerance: Social Conflict in the Age of the Crusades*. Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press, 2001.
- Grell, Ole Peter, and Bob Scribner, eds. *Tolerance and Intolerance in the European Reformation*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1996.
- Grell, Ole Peter, and Roy Porter, eds. *Toleration in Enlightenment Europe*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000.
- Guggisberg, Hans R. "Wandel der Argumente für religiöse Toleranz und Glaubensfreiheit im 16. und 17. Jahrhundert." In *Zur Geschichte der Toleranz und Religionsfreiheit*. Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, 1977.
- Henderson, John B. *The Construction of Orthodoxy and Heresy*. Albany: SUNY, 1998.
- Hirsch, Elisabeth Feist. "'De Arte Dubitandi' and the Problem of Religious Liberty." In *Autor De Michel Servet et de Sebastien Castellion*, edited by B. Becker. Haarlem: H. D. Tjeenk Willink & Zoon N. V., 1953.
- Jordan, W. K. C. *The Development of Religious Toleration in England*. 4 vols. London: Allen and Unwin, 1940.
- Kamen, Henry Arthur Francis. *The Rise of Toleration*. London: Weidenfield and Nicolson, 1967.
- Lactantius. *Divine Institutes*. Translated by Anthony Bowen and Peter Garnsey. Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 2003.
- Lamirande, Emillien. *Church, State and Toleration: An Intriguing Change of Mind in Augustine*. Villanova, PA: Villanova University Press, 1975.
- Las Casas, Bartolomé de. *The Only Way*. Translated by Francis Patrick Sullivan, S. J. Edited by Helen Rand Parish. Mahwah, NJ: Paulist, 1992.
- . *In Defense of the Indians*. Translated and edited by Stafford Poole. DeKalb, IL: Northern Illinois University Press, 1974.

- . *Apologética historia sumaria*. 2 Vols. Edited by Edmundo O' Gormon. Mexico City: Universidad Nacional Autónoma, 1967.
- Laursen, John C., ed. *Histories of Heresy in Early Modern Europe: For, Against, and Beyond Persecution and Toleration*. New York: Palgrave, 2002.
- Laursen, John C., and Cary J. Nederman, eds. *Beyond the Persecuting Society: Religious Toleration Before the Enlightenment*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1998.
- Lecler, Joseph. *Toleration and the Reformation*. 2 vols. Translated by T. L. Westow. New York: Association, 1960.
- Levine, Alab, ed. *Early Modern Skepticism and the Origins of Toleration*. Lanham, MD: Lexington, 1999.
- Llull, Ramon. *The Book of the Gentile and the Three Wise Men*. Translated by Anthony Bonner. In *The Selected Works of Ramon Llull (1232–1316)*, edited by Anthony Bonner. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1985.
- . *Vita Coetanea* (Contemporary Life). Translated by Anthony Bonner. In *Doctor Illuminatus: A Ramon Llull Reader*, edited by Anthony Bonner. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1985.
- Makdisi, George et al, eds. *The Concept of Freedom in the Middle Ages*. Paris: “Les Belles Lettres,” 1985.
- McDonald, Sister Mary Francis, ed. *Lactantius: The Minor Works*. Translated by Sister Mary Francis McDonald. Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 1965.
- Mendus, Susan, ed. *The Politics of Toleration in Modern Life*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2000.
- Moore, R. I. *The Formation of a Persecuting Society*. Oxford: Blackwell, 1987.
- Mullan, David George, ed. *Religious Pluralism in the West: An Anthology*. Oxford: Blackwell, 1998.
- Murphy, Andrew. *Conscience and Community*. University Park: Penn State University, 2001.
- Nederman, Cary J. *Worlds of Difference: European Discourses of Toleration: 1100–1550*. University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2000.
- Nederman, Cary J. and John Christian Laursen, eds. *Difference and Dissent*. Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield, 1996.
- Newman, Jay. *Foundations of Religious Tolerance*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1982.
- Patschovsky, Alexander, and Harald Zimmermann, eds. *Toleranz im Mittelalter*. Sigmaringen: Jan Thorbecke, 1998.
- Remer, Gary. *Humanism and the Rise of Toleration*. University Park, PA: Penn State, 1996.
- Reynolds, Noel, and W. C. Durham, eds. *Religious Liberty in Western Thought*. Atlanta: Scholar's, 1996.
- Sandel, Michael. “Judgemental Toleration.” In *Natural Law, Liberalism, and Morality: Contemporary Essays*, edited by Robert George. New York: Oxford University Press, 1996.

- Sanderlin, George, ed. *Witness: Writings of Bartolomé de Las Casas*. Foreword by Gustavo Gutiérrez. Maryknoll: NY: Orbis, 1992.
- Schreiner, Klaus. "Toleranz." In *Geschichtliche Grundbegriffe*, edited by Otto Brunner, Werner Coeze and Reinhardt Koselleck. Volume 6. Stuttgart, Germany: E. Klett): 445–605.
- Shiels, W. J., ed. *Persecution and Toleration*. Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1984.
- Stetson, Brad and Joseph G. Conti. *The Truth about Tolerance: Pluralism, Diversity, and the Culture Wars*. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2005.
- Van Loon, Hendrick W. *Tolerance*. New York: Boni & Liveright, 1925.
- Waldron, Jeremy. *God, Locke, and Equality*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002.
- Zagorin, Perez. *How the Idea of Religious Toleration Came to the West*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2003.

### Articles

- Bejczy, Istvan. "Tolerantia: A Medieval Concept." *Journal of the History of Ideas* 58 (1997): 365–84.
- Digester, DePalma Elizabeth. "Lactantius, Porphyry, and the Debate over Religious Toleration." *The Journal of Roman Studies* 88 (1998): 129–46.
- Guggisberg, Hans R. "The Defense of Religious Toleration and Religious Liberty in Early Modern Europe: Arguments, Pressures, and Some Consequences." *History of European Ideas* 4, no. 1 (1983): 35–50.
- Laursen, John Christian, and Cary J. Nederman. "The Problem of Periodization in the History of Toleration." *Storia della Storiographica* 37 (2000): 55–65.
- Lorenzo, David. "Tradition and Prudence in Locke's Exception to Toleration." *American Journal of Political Science* 47 (2003): 248–58.
- McClure, Kristi. "Difference, Diversity and the Limits of Toleration." *Political Theory* 18 (1990): 361–91.
- Murphy, Andrew. "Tolerance, Toleration, and the Liberal Tradition." *Polity* 29, no. 4 (1997): 593–624.
- Rohr, John H. "Religious Toleration in Augustine." *Journal of Church and State* 9 (Winter 1967): 51–70.
- Shogimen, Takashi. "From Disobedience to Toleration: William of Ockham and the Medieval Discourse of Fraternal Correction." *Journal of Ecclesiastical History* 52 (2001): 599–622.
- Turchetti, Mario. "Religious Concord and Political Tolerance in Sixteenth- and Seventeenth-Century France." *Sixteenth Century Journal* 22 (1991): 15–25.

## Tolerance and Islamic Civilization

### Books

- Abd Al-Rahman, Awang. *The Status of the Dhimmī in Islamic Law*. Kuala Lumpur: International Law, 1994.

- Ahmad, Ishtiaq. *The Concept of an Islamic State: An Analysis of the Ideological Controversy in Pakistan*. London: Francis Pinter, 1987.
- Al-Ghazali, Abu Hamid. *On the Boundaries of Theological Tolerance in Islam*. Introduced and translated by Sherman A. Jackson. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002.
- An-Naim, Abdullahi Ahmad. *Toward an Islamic Reformation: Civil Liberties, Human Rights and International Law*. New York: Syracuse University Press, 1990.
- Binder, Leonard. *Islamic Liberalism: A Critique of Development Ideologies*. Chicago: University of Chicago, 1988.
- Biswanger, K. *Untersuchungen zum Status der Nichtmuslime im Osmanischen Reich des 16. Jahrhunderts. Mit einer Neuen Definition des Begriffes "Dimma."* Beitrag zur Kenntnis Südost Europas und des Nahen Orients. Munich: R. Torfenik, 1977.
- Black, Antony. *History of Islamic Political Thought: From the Prophet to the Present*. New York: Routledge, 2001.
- Boullata, Isa J. "Fa-stabiqu 'l-khayrat: A Qur'anic Principle of Interfaith Relations." In *Christian-Muslim Encounters*, edited by Yvonne Y. Haddad and Wadi Z. Haddad. Gainesville, FL: University Press of Florida, 1995.
- Braude, Benjamin and Bernard Lewis, eds. *Christians and Jews in the Ottoman Empire: The Functioning of a Plural Society*. New York: Holmes and Meier, 1982.
- Cohen, Joshua, and Ian Lague, eds. *The Place of Tolerance in Islam*. Boston: Beacon, 2002.
- Cohen, Joshua, and Deborah Chasman, eds. *Islam and the Challenge of Democracy*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2004.
- Donaldson, Dwight M. *Studies in Muslim Ethics*. London: S. P. C. K., 1953.
- Fakhry, Majid. *Ethical Theories in Islam*. Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1994.
- Forte, David. "Religious Toleration in Classical Islam." In *International Perspectives on Church and State*, edited by Menehaem Mor. Omaha, NE: Creighton University Press, 1993.
- Franz, Erhard. *Minderheiten im Vorderen Orient: Auswahlbibliographie*. Hamburg: Deutsches Orient-Institut, 1978.
- Friedmann, Yohanan. *Tolerance and Coercion in Islam: Interfaith Relations in the Muslim Tradition*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003.
- Goodman, Lenn E. *Islamic Humanism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003.
- Griffel, F. *Apostasie und Toleranz im Islam: Die Entwicklung zu al-Ġazālīs Urteil Gegen die Philosophie und die Reaktionen der Philosophen*. Leiden: E. J. Brill, 2000.
- Gülen, Fethullah. *Prophet Muhammad: The Infinite Light*. London: Truestar, 1995.
- Hussain, Showkat. *Minorities, Islam and the Nation State*. Kuala Lumpur: Islamic Book Trust, 1997.
- Iqbal, Mohammad. *The Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam*. Lahore: Ashraf, reprinted 1960.
- Kamali, Mohammad Hashim. *Freedom, Justice, and Equality in Islam*, 2nd ed. Cambridge: Islamic Texts Society, 2002.

- . *The Dignity of Man: An Islamic Perspective*. Cambridge: Islamic Texts Society, 2002.
- Kerber, Walter, ed. *Wie Tolerant ist der Islam?* Munich: Kindt, 1991.
- Khouj, Abdullah Muhammad. *Religious Tolerance in Islam*. 2nd ed. Washington, DC: The Islamic Center 1992.
- Khuri, Richard K. *Freedom, Modernity, and Islam*. New York: Syracuse University Press, 1998.
- Kurzman, Charles, ed. *Liberal Islam: A Sourcebook*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1998.
- Lewis, Bernard. *The Jews of Islam*. New Haven, CT: Princeton University Press, 1984.
- Masters, Bruce. *Christians and Jews in the Ottoman Arab World: The Roots of Sectarianism*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001.
- Maududi, Abul A'la. *Human Rights in Islam*. Leicester: Islamic Foundation, 1980.
- . *Rights of Non-Muslims in the Islamic State*. Lahore: Islamic Publications, 1982.
- . *First Principles of the Islamic State*. Lahore: Islamic Publications, 1983.
- Mottahedeh, Roy P. "Toward an Islamic Theology of Toleration." In *Islamic Law Reform and Human Rights*, edited by Tore Lindholm & Kari Vogt. Copenhagen: Nordic Human Rights, 1993.
- Müller, Lorenz. *Islam und Menschenrechte. Sunnitische Muslim zwischen Islamismus, Säkularismus und Modernismus*. Hamburg: Deutsches Orient-Institut, 1996.
- Nazir-Ali, Michael. *The Roots of Islamic Tolerance: Origin and Development*. Oxford Project for Peace Studies. Oxford, 1990.
- Paret, R. "Innerislamischer Pluralismus." In *Die Islamische Welt zwischen Mittelalter und Neuzeit*, edited by P. Bachmann, and U. Haarmann. Beirut: Beirut Texts und Studien, 1979.
- Qutb, Sayyid. *Social Justice in Islam*. Translated by William E. Shepard. Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1996.
- Rizvi, A. A. *The Religious and Intellectual History of Muslims in Akbar's Reign with Special Reference to Abu'l Fadl (1556–1605)*. New Delhi: M. Manoharlal, 1975.
- Rosenthal, Franz. *The Muslim Concept of Freedom Prior to the Nineteenth Century*. Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1960.
- Sachedina, Abdulaziz. "Freedom of Conscience and Religion in the Qur'ān." In *Human Rights and the Conflict of Cultures*, edited by D. Little, J. Kelsay, and A. A. Sachedina. Columbia: University of South Carolina Press, 1988.
- Saeed, Abdullah, and Hassan Saeed. *Freedom of Religion, Apostasy and Islam*. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2004.
- Shoufani, E. *Al-rida and the Muslim Conquest of Arabia*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press and the Arab Institute for Research and Publishing, 1973.
- Smith, Jane. "Islam and Christendom: Historical, Cultural, and Religious Interactions from the Seventh to the Fifteenth Centuries." In *The Oxford History of Islam*, edited by John L. Esposito. New York: Oxford University Press, 1999.
- Sonn, T. *Islam and the Question of Minorities*. Atlanta: Scholars', 1996.



- Souroush, 'Abdolkarim. *Reason and Democracy in Islam: Essential Writings of 'Abdolkarim Soroush*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2000.
- Vahid, Syed Abdul. *Thoughts and Reflections of Iqbal*. Lahore: Sh. Muhammad Ashraf, 1964.
- Wisnar, Adolph L. *A Study in Tolerance as Practiced by Muhammad and His Immediate Successors*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1927.
- Yavus, M. Hakan and John L. Esposito, eds. *Turkish Islam and the Secular State: The Gülen Movement*. Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press, 2003.

### Articles

- Abou el-Fadl, Khaled. "Islamic Law and Muslim Minorities: The Juristic Discourse on Muslim Minorities from the Second/Eighth to the Eleventh/Seventeenth Centuries." *Islamic Law and Society* 1 (1994): 141–87.
- . "The Culture of Ugliness in Modern Islam and Reengaging Morality." *UCLA Journal of Islamic and Near Eastern Law* 2, no. 1 (2003): 33–98.
- Ahmed, Shihab. "Ibn Taymiyya and the Satanic Verses." *Studia Islamica* 87 (1988): 67–124.
- Ayoub, Mahmoud. "Islam and Christianity: Between Tolerance and Acceptance." *Islam and Christian-Muslim Relations* (December 1991) 171–81.
- . "Religious Freedom and the Law of Apostasy in Islam." *Islamochristiana* 20 (1994): 15–91.
- Douglas, Elmer H. "The Theological Position of Islam Concerning Religious Liberty." *The Ecumenical Review* 13 (1960–1961): 450–62.
- Friedmann, Yohanan. "Classification of Unbelievers in Sunni Muslim Law and Tradition." *Jerusalem Studies in Arabic and Islam* 22 (1998): 163–95.
- Hashmi, Sohail. "The Qur'an and Tolerance: An Interpretive Essay on Verse 5:48." *Journal of Human Rights* 2, no. 1 (March 2003):
- Highland, James. "Guidance, Tolerance, and the Reverent Mindset in the thought of al- Ghazzali and Symeon." *The Muslim World* 94, no. 2 (April 2004): 259–73.
- Mazrui, Ali. "Islamic and Western Values." *Foreign Affairs* 76, no. 5 (September/October 1997): 118–132.
- Neufeldt, Ronald. "Islam and India: The Views of Muhammad Iqbal, *The Muslim World* 71 (July–October 1981).
- Noth, A. "Möglichkeiten und Grenzen islamischer Toleranz." *Saeculum* 29 (1993): 190–204.
- Paret, R. "Toleranz und Intoleranz im Islam." *Saeculum* 21 (1970): 344–65.
- Sachedina, Abdulaziz. "Political Implications of the Islamic Notion of 'Supersession' as Reflected in Islamic Jurisprudence." *Islam and Christian Muslim Relations* 7 (1996): 159–68.
- Savory, Roger M. "Relations between the Safavid State and its Non-Muslim Minorities." *Islam and Christian Muslim Relations* 14, no. 4 (2003): 435–59.
- Watt, W. Montgomery. "Conditions of Membership of the Islamic Community." *Studia Islamica* 21 (1964): 5–12.

# Index

- Abd al-Rahim, Muddathir, 110–11  
Abd al-Wahhab, Muhammad Ibn, 97–99  
Abdullah II (king), 24  
Abelard, Peter, 54–55, 179–80  
Abu Hafs al-Masri Brigade, 20  
Ahmad, Eqbal, 142  
Ahmed, Akbar, 13, 25, 29, 31, 173  
Ahmed, Khurshid, 27  
Akbar, Jalal-ud-Din, 133  
Al-Dustur, 149  
Alexander VI (pope), 62  
al-Farabi, 113–14, 179  
Alphonso X (the Wise), 53, 153  
al-Qaeda, 2, 19–20, 25, 40, 98, 104, 116  
*Al-Watan*, 149  
An-Na'im, Abdullahi Ahmed, 25, 38, 176  
*Apologetic History* (Las Casas), 62  
Aquinas, Thomas, 8, 52, 183  
Aristotle, 61, 63, 113, 179  
Armstrong, Karen, 151, 201  
Arshad, M. D., 135  
Arkoun, Mohammed, 36, 107  
Ataturk, Mustafa Kemal, 94, 124, 146  
Augsburg, Peace of, 9, 136–37  
Augustine, 70  
Aurangzeb, 136, 154  
Ayoub, Mahmoud, 22  
Babur, Padshah Zahir-ud-din Muhammad, 117, 133, 134, 156  
Bakr, Abu, 111  
Banna, Hasan al-, 97, 190  
Baqir, Muhammad, 144  
Barber, Benjamin, 31  
Baroody, Jamil, 33  
Bayle, Pierre, 69  
Bejczy, Istvan, 8  
Bencheikh, Soheib, 89  
Benedict XVI (pope), 37, 175  
Berkes, Niyazi, 125  
Besant, Sir Walter, 87  
Betts, Richard K., 30  
bin Laden, Osama, 16, 20–21, 98, 104, 161, 189  
Black, Anthony, 113–14, 142  
Bodin, Jean, 45, 59, 65–70, 88, 90, 154–55, 159, 183, 188  
Bonner, Anthony, 56, 180  
Bouyeri, Mohammed, 23  
Budziszewski, J., 7, 10, 70, 81, 84–85, 156, 159, 186–87  
Buruma, Ian, 23  
Bush, George W., 19, 28  
Cahen, C. L., 119  
caritas, 40, 49–50, 54, 63–64, 106, 159  
Cicero, 62  
Chesterton, G. K., 83  
Choueiri, Youssef, 100, 190  
*Christians and Jews in the Ottoman Arab World* (Masters), 121  
Christian Zionism, 37  
*Clash of Civilizations* (Huntington), 1, 13, 14,  
Cohen, Stephen P., 140–41  
*Colloquium Heptaplomeres de Rerum Sublimium Arcanis Abditis* (Bodin), 66–68, 155, 160  
Constantine, 47, 49, 153, 177  
Constantius II, 46  
consumerism, 2, 31–32, 103, 105  
Conyers, A. J., 78–80, 83–85, 164

- Council on American-Islamic Relations, 25  
 Creppell, Ingrid, 68  
 crusade, 36, 53, 121, 150, 178–79  
 cultural-comparative model, 3–4, 10, 13, 15–18, 147–48
- Daily Telegraph, 20  
 Dallmayr, Fred, 3–4  
*Dar al-harb*, 24, 101, 110, 165  
*Dar al-Islam*, 1, 24–26, 93, 101, 103, 110–11, 118–22, 153, 165  
*Dar al-kufr*, 1, 165  
 Declaration of Tolerance (UNESCO), 86  
*Decretum* (Gratian), 63  
*De Pace Fidei* (Nicholas of Cusa), 68  
 Delong-Bas, Natana J., 98, 109  
 Delors, Jacques, 17  
 Demarco, Donald, 73, 82–85  
 deterritorialization, 2  
*dhimma*, 11, 100, 109, 119–23, 134, 136, 143, 145, 153, 195  
 Diocletian, 49, 177  
 Dionysius, 63  
*Divine Institutes*, 47, 178  
 Durham, Cole, 14, 107
- Efendi, Ebussuûd, 121  
 Eickelman, Dale, 106  
 Elizabeth II (queen), 24  
 Erdogan, Recep Tayyip, 126  
 Ershad, General Hussain, 94  
 Espositio, John, 93
- Fadl, Khaled Abou El, 1, 10, 14–17, 25, 30, 104–9, 115, 135, 144, 147, 151, 155, 159–60  
 Faubert, Serge, 148  
 Feldman, Noah, 97, 101, 109  
 Fourth Lateran Council (1215), 52  
 France Soir, 148–49  
 Frederick II, 52–53, 153, 178  
 Friedmann, Yohanan, 10
- Galerius, 47, 177  
 Globalised Islam (Roy), 22  
 globalization, 4, 21–22, 30–31, 73, 90, 127, 161  
 Goodman, Lenn, 116, 192, 198  
 Gratian, 63–64  
 Gregory IX, 52  
 Grell, Ole Peter, 59, 176–77, 181  
 Guantánamo Bay, 29  
 Gul, Abdullah, 126  
 Güllen, Fethullah, 25, 107, 117, 127–30, 146, 159
- Habash, Muhammad, 25  
 hadith, 97, 111–13, 146, 148, 156, 193  
 Hafez, 115  
 Hamilton, Bernard, 44, 51, 178  
 Haq, General Zia ul-, 94  
 Havel, Vaclav, 147, 157  
 Heawood, Jonathan, 24  
 Hecini, Abida, 89  
 Herben, Matt, 23  
 hijab, 75, 78, 150  
 Hilary of Poitiers, 46, 67, 69  
 Holness, Garri, 20  
 Huntington, Samuel P., 1–2, 13–14, 16–17, 26, 28–30, 40, 161  
 Huss, Jan, 44
- ijma, 3, 145  
*ijtihad*, 3, 142, 145  
*imago Dei*, 62, 157, 188  
*In Defense of the Indians* (De Las Casas), 62–63  
 individualism, 2, 28, 31–32, 78, 144  
 infidel, 52, 54, 98, 102, 119, 121, 154, 170. See also *Kafir*  
 Innocent III, 52  
 Innocent IV, 52  
 Iqbal, Muhammad, 9, 133, 137–42, 146, 157, 159  
*Islamic Fundamentalism* (Choueiri), 100  
 Islamism, 96–99, 101–6, 116, 126, 130–32, 139  
 Islamophobia, 22, 150

*Islam: Religion, History, and  
Civilization* (Nasr), 96

Jahangir, 135

jahiliyya, 101–4, 190

Jamaat-e-Islami, 26–27, 99, 141

Jargy, Simon, 35

Jenkins, Philip, 36, 73–74, 175, 184

Jesus, 45–46, 48, 63

*jihad*, 31, 36, 98, 103–4, 109, 121, 136

*Jihad vs. McWorld* (Barber), 31

Jinnah, Muhammad Ali, 9, 137,  
140–42, 146

*Jizya*, 100, 103, 106, 119, 134, 136, 143

July 7, 2005, 20

*Jyllands-Posten*, 148

Kadioglu, Ayse, 124, 197

kafir, 54, 121, 154. *See also* infidel

Kamali, Mohammad Hashim, 108,  
112–13, 146

Karzai, Hamid, 149

Kennicott, Kenneth, 151

Khaqani, Nur al-Din al-, 135, 144

Khomeini, Ayatollah Ruhollah, 23, 94

Kidder, Rushworth M., 91, 187

Kissinger, Henry, 37

Koran (Qur'an), 20, 33, 97, 108–9,  
112–15, 131, 165, 174

Koru, Fehmi, 150

Kramer, Martin, 96

Kuftaro, Sheikh Ahmad Muhammad  
Amin, 4

Kuntz, Marion Leathers, 66

Kurtz, Stanley, 29

Kuru, Ahmet, 128

Lactantius, Lucius Caelilius Firmianus,  
47–50, 65, 69, 153, 155, 178

Larsson, Gören, 22–23

Las Casas, Bartolomé de, 45, 59–65,  
69–70, 90, 155, 157, 160, 182, 188

Lash, Nicholas, 79

Laursen, John Christian, 6–7, 42–4,  
162,

Lausanne Treaty of 1923, 125

Lewis, Bernard, 4–5, 35, 93, 123, 174,  
179, 191

*Liber de Gentili et Tribus Sapientibus*  
(Llull), 56–57

*Liber Augustalis*, 52

Licinius, 47, 177

Llull, Ramon, 45, 54–58, 65–66, 68–69,  
88, 90, 153, 155–56, 159, 180–81,  
188

Locke, John, 69

*Long Truce, The* (Conyers), 78

Mahmood, Saba, 28

Major, John, 60–61

Marty, Martin, 164

Maritain, Jacques, 83

Masters, Bruce, 121–22, 194

materialism, 2, 31–32, 103, 105, 128

Maududi, Abul A'la, 99–104, 141–42

Meeder, Michael, 127, 197

Mehmet, Ozay, 129, 145

Milan, Edict of, (313), 47, 49, 153

Millet, 123–25, 144–45, 153, 196

*Mlada Fronta Dnes*, 149

More, Thomas, 41, 69

Moussalli, Ahmad S., 102

Mubarak, Hosni, 149

Muhammad, 23, 32–34, 98, 105,  
109–12, 119, 131, 141, 148–49, 155,  
159

Mujahid, Sharif al-, 133

Murad, Khurram, 27

*Murder in Amsterdam*, 23

Musharraf, General Pervez, 132,  
142–43

Muslim Brotherhood, 97, 101–2, 190

Nantes, Edict of (1598), 65

Nasr, Seyyed Hossein, 27, 36, 96, 106,  
161–62, 172

Nasr, Vali, 118

Nederman, Cary, 7, 9, 42–44, 54–59,  
71, 84

Nehru, Jawaharlal, 137, 139

neofundamentalism, 22, 170

Neufeldt, Ronald, 137–38

- New Laws of 1542, 65  
 Nicholas of Cusa, 68  
 Novak, Michael, 94–95
- Oberman, Heiko, 42, 176  
 Only Way, The (Las Casas), 62–63  
*On Toleration* (Walzer), 8–9
- Pakistan: Blasphemy Law, 131;  
     Constitution of the Islamic  
     Republic of (1973), 130–31, 141  
 Paleologus, Manuel, II, 37  
 Parel, Anthony, 3–4  
 Pickthall, Marmaduke, 41  
 Pilate, Pontius, 83  
 Place of Tolerance in Islam, The (El  
     Fadl), 10, 104  
*Politics* (Aristotle), 61  
 Prophet, the. *See* Muhammad  
*pseudo-tolerance*, 73, 82–83
- Qutb, Sayyid, 98, 101–4, 189–90  
 qiyas, 3, 145
- Rahman, Sheikh Mujibar, 94  
 Rahman, Ziaur, 94  
 Rasmussen, Anders Fogh, 149  
 Rawls, John, 80–82, 91, 157, 187  
 Reconquista, 20  
 Reformation, European, 59, 66, 80, 181  
 relativism, 2–3, 9, 154, 161  
*Requerimiento*, 60, 62, 70, 181  
*Respublica Christiana*, 54  
 Revolution: French, 76; Iranian (1979),  
     25, 94  
 Roald, Anne Sofie, 23  
 Roy, Olivier, 21–22, 74, 170  
 Rumi, Mowlana Jalal-al-Din, 115, 156  
 Rushdie, Salman, 23–24
- Sachedina, Abdulaziz A., 25  
 Savory, Roger M., 108  
 Saeed, Abdullah, 33  
 Saeed, Hassan, 33  
 Sandel, Michael, 77, 82  
 Satanic Verses, The (Rushdie), 23  
 Scapula, 46
- Scribner, Bob, 59  
 Sepúlveda, Juan Ginés de, 61–62, 65,  
     182  
 September 11, 2001, 1, 3, 19, 22, 25, 29,  
     96, 106  
 Servetus, Michael, 44  
*shari'a*, 27, 34, 99–100, 108, 110, 114,  
     122, 136, 142  
 Sina, Ibn, 113–14, 179  
*sira*, 112  
 Smith, Jane, 120–21, 195  
 Soroush, Abdolkarim, 25, 93, 114–16,  
     146, 156, 165, 189, 193  
*Sueddeutsche Zeitung*, 149  
 suicide-bombing, 21, 142, 148  
*sunna*, 112–13, 128, 131, 156
- Talbi, Muhammad, 22, 25, 29, 35,  
     38–39, 107, 164, 174  
 Talib, Ali ibn Abi, 93, 117  
 Taliban, 104, 172–73  
 Tanzimat Reforms (1839), 124  
 Tapper, Richard, 124  
 tawhid, 138  
 terrorism, 1–3, 6, 19, 25–26, 30, 143,  
     150; war on, 129, 142, 150  
 Tertullian, 45–46, 48, 69  
 Third Mexican Council of 1585, 65  
 Tierney, Brian, 51  
 Tillich, Paul, 85  
 tolerance: cross-cultural definition,  
     158–60; compared to toleration,  
     6–7  
*Tolerance and Coercion in Islam*  
     (Friedmann), 10  
*Treatise on Tolerance* (Soroush), 114  
 Trent, Council of (1545–1563), 65  
*True Tolerance* (Budziszewski), 10, 84
- Umar, Pact of, 119, 194  
 Universal Declaration of Human  
     Rights (1948), 32–33  
 Universal Hunger of Liberty, The  
     (Novak), 94

- Van Gogh, Theo, 23  
via media, 94, 127–29, 162  
*Vita coetanea* (Llull), 55–56  
Voegelin, Eric, 4
- Wahhabi Islam (DeLong-Bas), 98  
Wahhabism, 98–99, 104  
Walzer, Michael, 4, 6, 8–9, 76–77, 90,  
122–23, 145, 152, 163, 196, 202
- Ward, Nathaniel, 70  
*Washington Post*, 151  
Williams, Roger, 69–70  
*Worlds of Difference* (Nederman), 9  
*Yeni Safak*, 150  
Zarqawi, Abu Musab al-, 160–61