

The Epistemology of Religious Disagreement

The Epistemology of
Religious Disagreement
A Better Understanding

James Kraft

palgrave
macmillan



THE EPISTEMOLOGY OF RELIGIOUS DISAGREEMENT

Copyright © James Kraft, 2012.

Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 2012 978-0-230-11190-5

All rights reserved.

First published in 2012 by PALGRAVE MACMILLAN®
in the United States—a division of St. Martin's Press
LLC, 175 Fifth Avenue, New York, NY 10010.

Where this book is distributed in the UK, Europe and the rest of the world, this is by Palgrave Macmillan, a division of Macmillan Publishers Limited, registered in England, company number 785998, of Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS.

Palgrave Macmillan is the global academic imprint of the above companies and has companies and representatives throughout the world.

Palgrave® and Macmillan® are registered trademarks in the United States, the United Kingdom, Europe and other countries.

ISBN 978-1-349-29414-5

ISBN 978-1-137-01510-5 (eBook)

DOI 10.1057/9781137015105

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data is available from the Library of Congress.

A catalogue record of the book is available from the British Library.

Design by Scribe Inc.

First edition: May 2012

*To those who help me remain tethered: Gülis, Kurt,
Helen, Jim, Gülar, İsmail . . .*

Contents

Acknowledgments	ix
Introduction	1
Part I The Epistemology of Ordinary Disagreements	7
1 Justified True Belief?	9
2 Varieties of Luck and Possible Worlds	37
3 Skepticism between Beginner's and Lottery Luck	59
4 Ordinary Disagreements	69
Part II From Ordinary to Religious Disagreements	95
5 Ordinary and Religious Disagreements Compared	97
6 Exclusivism, Pluralism, Postmodernism, Contextualism, and Hermeneutics	109
7 Nonreductive Religious Disagreement	121
8 Reduction	129
Notes	155
Bibliography	173
Index	181

Acknowledgments

I must give many thanks for inspiration and guidance to David Basinger, Frank Schubert, Philip Quinn (whom I miss dearly since he passed), Duncan Pritchard, John Greco, Richard Feldman, David Christensen, Tom Kelly, Jerome Gellman, Jonathan Kvanvig, Jennifer Lackey, Robert McKim, Max Goss, Liz Goss, Jon Hamilton, Mike Lewis, Murat Baç, Berna Kılınc, Sun Demirli, Ivan Soll, Lucas Thorpe, Stephen Voss, Douglas Oro, Christopher Colvin, Geoffrey Bowe, Jonathan Mahoney, Yetkin Yildirim, Brandon Woodson, Donelle Starke, Don Jones, DeChard Freeman, Damian Spencer, Cory Juhl, Robert Koons, Stephen Phillips, Peter Degen, Robert Russell, Ted Peters, David Stagaman, Larry Earvin, Vicki Lott, Alaine Hutson, Katherine Oldmixon, Stephen Burnaman, Janice Sumler-Edmond, Steven Edmond, Mike Hirsch, Donald Brewington, Gloria Quinlan, Javier Stuppard, Mike Hart, Dean Keddy-Hector, Kathryn Davis, Laura Smith, Rosalee Martin, Paul Anaejionu, Kathy Schwab, Philip Clayton, Amanda Masino, Bryce North, Julie Hudson, Paula Battistelli, Ashley Williams, Eric Budd, R. McCabe, Ruth Kane, Debra Murphy, Lorraine Samuels, Betty Etier, Yusuf Yildirim, Engin Topkara, Carol Adams-Means, Andrew Lofters, Raymond Hawkins, Bradley Rowland, Douglas Kutach, Michael Moreau, Kemba Thomas, Monica Ciccirelli, Thereisa Coleman, Behrooz Karimi, and everyone else who helped me along the way.