

The Nanjing Massacre and Sino-Japanese Relations

Zhaoqi Cheng

The Nanjing Massacre and Sino-Japanese Relations

Examining the Japanese 'Illusion' School



上海交通大学出版社
SHANGHAI JIAO TONG UNIVERSITY PRESS

palgrave
macmillan

Zhaoqi Cheng
Shanghai Jiao Tong University
Shanghai, China

Translated by
Fangbin Yang
Wuxi Canal Experimental Middle School
Wuxi, China

This book is funded by “B&R” Book Program.

ISBN 978-981-15-7886-1 ISBN 978-981-15-7887-8 (eBook)
<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-15-7887-8>

Jointly published with Shanghai Jiao Tong University Press
The print edition is not for sale in China Mainland. Customers from China Mainland please
order the print book from: Shanghai Jiao Tong University Press.
ISBN of the China Mainland edition: 9787313183620

Translation from the Chinese language edition: 南京大屠杀研究——日本虚构派批判 by Cheng,
Zhaoqi, © Shanghai Jiao Tong University Press 2017. All Rights Reserved.
© Shanghai Jiao Tong University Press 2020

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are solely and exclusively licensed by the Publisher,
whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation,
reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any
other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation,
computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this
publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are
exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publishers, the authors, and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in
this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publishers
nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material
contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publishers remain
neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

This Palgrave Macmillan imprint is published by the registered company Springer Nature
Singapore Pte Ltd.
The registered company address is: 152 Beach Road, #21-01/04 Gateway East, Singapore
189721, Singapore

FOREWORD BY JIANJUN ZHANG

Zhaoqi Cheng, modest, determined and rich in works, has in-depth research on the Nanjing Massacre and post-war trials. For a newcomer like me who is just engaged in historical works, Zhaoqi is like a tutor and a brother. This year marks the 80th anniversary of the Nanjing Massacre, along with Zhaoqi Cheng's *Nanjing Massacre Research—A Critique of the Japanese Fiction School* which is being published and is worth celebrating.

The Nanjing Massacre took place in the winter of 1937 and was an important event in the history of World War II. Due to its cruelty, the post-war Far East International Military Court conducted a case trial after an extensive investigation. As the oriental main battlefield of World War II, China won the respect of the world with its tenacity and heroism. It established the Military Court of Nanjing for War Crimes Trials according to the international division of labor and also focused on the trial of the Nanjing Massacre. In essence, the Nanjing Trial, in conjunction with the Tokyo Trial, was an international court based on justice. The judgments had irrefutable authority and legitimacy.

The image of the God of justice is a scale in one hand and a sword in another hand. It may be insufficient to weigh the justice through the scale, so upholding justice with a sword is indispensable. In the past few years, the history of the Nanjing Massacre with sufficient evidence and legal basis has been painfully distorted and even tampered with. Faced with this situation, researchers, like Zhaoqi Cheng, took pens as swords and guarded China's historical truth with solid historical evidence and cultural education which is admirable.

This history of blood and fire has been around for 80 years, but no matter how long time goes on, the truth will always remain there, not blurred, or faded. It declares the history and alarms future generations. The poet Oden once said, "After Auschwitz, writing poetry was barbaric". This statement implies a distrust toward human civilization. The existence of the Nanjing

Massacre has no other function than alerting the masses. As is put in the judgment of the Tokyo Trial, “The extent of its brutality is rare in human history. After insulting and raping women, Japanese forced fathers-in-law to rape their daughters-in-law, fathers to rape their daughters, sons to rape their mothers and monks to rape young girls with humiliation”. This savagery, destruction of human relations, is far from the essence of what makes us human beings.

In October 2015, UNESCO listed the Nanjing Massacre Archives on the Memory of the World, which represents that the Nanjing Massacre is officially recognized as a common memory for all human beings and is an international event from an archival perspective. Frankly, the painful memories of the Nanjing Massacre belong to all of mankind and is an integral part of the process of human civilization that should be reflected on all the time. It is supposed to have an enduring impact on modern civilization, to urge everyone to rethink what happened at that time, to promote mutual understanding and to form a warm expectation of world peace and to completely reject future massacres.

So far, the history of the Nanjing Massacre needs further attention from the international community. The historical truth of the Nanjing Massacre needs to be further clarified by criticizing and refuting some ridiculous remarks with ulterior motives. In this way, I look forward to more people with lofty ideals and insights to participate in the research and dissemination of the history of the Nanjing Massacre by contributing research, the inheritance of memory and conveying the truth. I would like to take advantage of this opportunity to pay tribute to Zhaoqi Cheng and colleagues who have devoted themselves to the research and dissemination of the history of the Nanjing Massacre.

Jiangdong gate, Nanjing, China
August 2017

JianJun Zhang
Director of Memorial Hall for the
Victims of the Nanjing Massacre
Executive Director of the Nanjing Holocaust
History and International Peace Research Institute

FOREWORD BY SUN ZHAIWEI

DO MORE RESEARCH ON NANJING MASSACRE IN CRITICISM

2017 marks the 80th anniversary of Anti-Japanese war and the Nanjing massacre. As time passes by, there are fewer and fewer soldiers and survivors of Nanjing Massacre. Only a hundred survivors are registered in the memorial hall of the Victims of the Nanjing Massacre by Japanese invaders. However, the history of Nanjing massacre remains and has great influence. Publishing all kinds of works about the Nanjing massacre is an important means of deepening the memory. At this point, Mr. Zhaoqi's *Nanjing Massacre Research—A Critique of the Japanese Fiction School* (hereinafter referred to “Critique”) comes out.

Zhaoqi and I met at the Nanjing Massacre Research Salon held by the research center Nanjing Massacre of Nanjing Normal University in early spring of 2003. Zhaoqi was specially invited to make a speech in the salon, which left me with a deep impression. I was spiritually attracted to Zhaoqi in 2000 when I learned from him about his translation work, “Nanjing Massacre and the Spirit World of Japanese” written by Tsuda Michio. I knew Zhaoqi at an early time. For over ten years, we have been in contact with each other, read many excellent works and I have benefited a lot. Zhaoqi, who is eloquent and of great talent, is known for the essays in *Historical Research* and *Modern Chinese History Studies*. I'm lucky to have had the opportunity to read his new book “*Critique*”. After reading, I gained some inspirations from this book and topic.

Since the 1980s, efforts by scholars, documents, pictures and monographs of the Nanjing massacre have sprung up. Among them there are comprehensive researches on the history of Nanjing massacre, such as Gao Xingzu's book, *The Atrocities Committed by Japanese Invaders-Nanjing Massacre*, and the groups' book, *A history of Nanjing Massacre by Japanese Invaders*, (Japan) Tomio Hora's book *The Nanjing Massacre*, (Japan) Kasahara Shijiushi's book

Nanjing Event, and Sun Zhaiwei as the editor-in-chief of *The Nanjing Massacre*, Chen Anji as the editor-in-chief of the *Collection of Papers of the International Symposium on the History of the Nanjing Massacre by Japanese Invaders*, and *Nanjing Massacre-Facts and Records* co-authored by Sun Zhaiwei and Wu Tianwei, and *New Research on Nanjing Massacre* edited by Liu Huishu, and *Collection of Papers on the Exchange of Latest Research Achievements in the History of the Nanjing Massacre by Japanese Invaders* edited by Zhu Chengshan, and *Cry for 300,000 Wrongful Souls—Zhu Chengshan's Collection of History and Literature on the Nanjing Massacre* (Volume I and Volume II) written by Zhu Chengshan, *Clarification of History-Studies and Reflections on the Nanjing Massacre* written by Sun Zhaiwei, *Nanjing Massacre and Japanese War Crimes-Collected Works of Gao Xingzu* written by Gao Xingzu, *The History of Nanjing Massacre* (first, second and third volumes) edited by Zhang Xianwen, *Research on Nanjing Massacre: History and Speech* (the first and second volumes) co-edited by Zhang Lianhong and Sun Zhaiwei, *Research on the History of Nanjing Massacre* (the first and second volumes of the updated versions) written by Zhang Sheng and others, etc. There are many works with authors both at home and abroad, each has his own perspective, each has his own characteristics and each has his own advantages. Most of these works are a comprehensive study of the history of the Nanjing Massacre and have detailed historical materials for research and discussion. Conclusions are based on historical evidence, which makes the whole picture of the Nanjing Massacre clear and detailed for the world.

It should be pointed out in particular that this book *Critique* is distinctive and unique in its research on the history of the Nanjing Massacre. As the name of this book reveals, this book constructs a new world for the study of the Nanjing Massacre and promotes the Nanjing Massacre to new heights by criticizing Japanese fictionalists. Mr. Zhaoqi, who lived and studied in Japan for many years, has a unique advantage. He knows all about the tricks and performances of the Japanese fictionalists who deny the Nanjing Massacre. He has very clear insight and hits his target every time without a miss. Fictionalists' remarks are absurd and uncountable. If you don't feel personally involved and persevere, it will be very difficult to capture their remarks, and it will be even more difficult to probe into the root cause of the problem. In this regard, Mr. Zhaoqi not only took advantage of the situation, but also because of his strict nature, quick thinking and hard work, he was able to calmly collect and sort out the fictional speeches one by one. He was able to refute them one by one by debunking lies and reconstructing the true history of the Nanjing Massacre. Making critique is a battle and an important mode of research. Persuasive criticism can bring forth new ideas and sublimates the theory of academic research. Successful critique requires a strong academic foundation. Mr. Zhaoqi has an excellent academic background and his critical writings are like spears and swords, which are extremely destructive and shocking. This makes his new book a unique academic monograph

with a strong fighting color, filling a gap in the research on the history of the Nanjing Massacre.

The publication of *Critique* is the need of the times and the product of the times. We live in an era of peace and development as the main theme, but not peace and tranquility. The Nanjing Massacre is a disaster and a humiliation that the Chinese people will never forget. The cries and blood of 300,000 dead compatriots have become the alarm bells of history. In the sound of the alarm bell, we seemed to hear the sound of machine guns massacring civilians and the grinning sound of Japanese invaders killing people for fun. This voice, full of terror and blood, is both distant and near. In that barbaric war launched by militarism, human dignity and morality were destroyed. The brutality, barbarity and madness of militarism are the source of all war atrocities. The Nanjing Massacre was a product of the vicious expansion of Japanese militarism.

Since the Meiji Restoration in the 1860s, Japan embarked on a path of militarism. Until the end of World War II, Japan surrendered unconditionally and was forced to terminate. During this period, it experienced Meiji, Taisho and Showa dynasties. Generally speaking, in the Meiji era, militarism began and extorted huge sums of money from China in order to enrich the construction of their navy and army and built a new industrial foundation. In the Taisho era, the degree of militarism developed further, taking advantage of the privileges already seized in China, plundering resources, exploiting labor and grabbing the market. In the Showa era, militarism reached its peak. The invasion of China also changed from a local war to a full-scale war, turning parts of China into Japanese colonies. Japanese militarism is characterized by its endless expansion abroad. Expansion requires conquest, which cannot be achieved without violence. In the history of Japanese militarism, aggression and violence were eliminated simultaneously. Wherever they invaded, they committed violence there. In the process of attacking Nanjing, they also killed people continually from Songhu battlefield to Nanjing. The difference is that the massacre in Nanjing was the most barbaric, craziest and largest.

After World War II, Japanese militarism was destroyed. However, as the Chinese saying goes, “trees want to be quiet but the wind does not allow it”. The forces of Japanese militarism and their influence, which brought great disasters to the people of China and the world, are far from being thoroughly criticized and liquidated. The right-wingers and bureaucratic politicians are still there representing the right-wing ideological trend. This was the soil for reviving militarism. Once the conditions were ripe, the poisonous mushroom of militarism broke through the ground. For more than 70 years, the international political situation has not been peaceful. A handful of right-wingers and politicians in Japan have repeatedly set off a counter-current and muddy wave of overturning their verdicts on the issue of invading China, East Asia and the Nanjing Massacre in an attempt to revive militarism, which has been swept into the dustbin of history. They sometimes adopt the method of revising textbooks in order to poison the younger generation and create soil for

the revival of militarism. Sometimes, they publish talks which confuse fact and fictional information in influential international magazines to confuse the international audience. Sometimes bureaucratic politicians use their status and position to launch attacks and expand the influence of the fallacy of overturning the verdict. Sometimes they put on cloaks of scholars and write books, seemingly objective, to confuse people who do not know the truth. Sometimes they were led by political leaders, to visit the Yasukuni Shrine which worships Class A war criminals, openly challenge the feelings of the people of China and all Asian countries invaded. This can be said to echo each other, cooperate with each other, and make deliberate efforts to achieve the same results.

History has proved that whenever war maniacs want to launch new wars of aggression and commit new war atrocity, he must first create public opinion and deny his past aggression and atrocities. Reversal of the verdict is intended to revive. The denial of the Nanjing Massacre by a small number of right-wingers in Japan is a denial of the whole history of aggression against China, which is aimed at creating public opinion for reviving militarism. Essentially, such overturning activities are the continuation and extension of Japanese militarism's aggression and violence. Meanwhile, it is also a prelude for the Japanese militarists to launch a new round of aggression and atrocities.

How can we prevent Japan's right-wing forces from overturning the verdict? How can we contain the resurrection of Japanese militarism? It is necessary to hold rallies, issue statements and solemnly denounce in order to crack down on the arrogance of right-wing forces. Fundamentally speaking, being down-to-earth, refuting and breaking lies one by one can make all the fallacies of overturning the verdict and public opinion of reviving militarism uncomprehensible to kind people. Mr. Zhaoqi's *Critique* is exactly the call of the times, which extinguishes the embers of militarism fundamentally. This is the greatest value of *Critique* published today.

The Nanjing Massacre, which took place 80 years ago, is still fresh in the memory of the Nanjing people, the Chinese people and the Chinese people all over the world. The alarm bell of history is ringing in people's ears. The painful history of the Nanjing Massacre calls for people to be alert and never allow the tragedy to repeat. The wheel of history is rolling forward. The Chinese people who overcame the history of the Nanjing Massacre and the Anti-Japanese War will never allow Japanese militarism to come back. The attempt by a very small number of people to revive Japanese militarism will never succeed. Maintaining peace, opposing war and promoting development are the common wishes and responsibilities of people all over the world. The remembrance of the past is the teacher of the future. Peace in Asia and the world can only be guaranteed if we unite as one, learn from history, and constantly guard against the revival of Japanese militarism.

I believe that the publication of *Critique* should be a fruitful response to the historical warning and a fatal blow to the resurgent militarists in Japan. This is a good start. The criticism of various fantastic theories of the fictionalists should be carried out in depth. The struggle has not yet come to an end. There is a long way to go for scholars to continue to deepen, refine and implement this Critique. I would like to share this with Mr. Zhaoqi and other academic colleagues to reach a mutual goal.

Nanjing, China
September 2017

Sun Zhaiwei

ABOUT THIS BOOK

The fictional claims of the Nanjing Massacre in Japan, which began in the early 1970s, have flourished since then, finally becoming widespread today. Many Japanese scholars, including Tomio Hora who was the first to study the Nanjing Massacre in the world and Mr. Tokushi Kasahara who is still endeavoring to it today, have made unremitting efforts to pursue the truth of the Nanjing Massacre, which is commendable. But so far there has not been a thorough clarification of fictional claims in Japan. This book is the first step in a long-planned and thorough effort to unveil the truth of Japanese fictional claims by focusing on the relevant developments in Japan and reading relevant historical materials.

CIP Data Cataloging in Publication

Nanjing Massacre Research: A Critique of Japanese Fiction School by Cheng Zhaoqi —Shanghai: Shanghai Jiao Tong University Press, 2017

ISBN 978-7-313-18362-0

I. ①Nan... II. ① Cheng... III. ①Nanjing Massacre Research

IV. ①K265. 607

China CIP Data Cataloging in Publication (2017) No. 271020

Nanjing Massacre Research: A Critique of Japanese Fiction School

Author: Cheng Zhaoqi

Publishing House: Shanghai Jiao Tong University Press

Address: No.95, Fanyu Road, Shanghai

Tel: 021-64071208

Postal Code: 20030

Publisher: Tan Yi

Distribution: Xinhua Bookstore

Printing: Jiangsu Suzhong Printing Co., Ltd.

Folio: 710 mm × 1000 mm, 1 / 16

Print: 35

Word Count: 504,000

First Printing: January, 2018

Published: January 1, 2018

ISBN978-7-313-18362-0 / K

Price: 128.00 yuan

Copyright preserved

To readers: If you find any quality problems in this book, please contact the Quality Department of the printing factory at 0523-641646.

AUTHOR'S NOTE

First, for historical terms that are ambiguous in meaning, we use what they have been originally used in this book. For example, the “Chinese Army in Central Area” is mostly changed to the “Central China Army”. Considering what Japanese call “Central Area in China” and what Chinese call “Central China”, whether it is according to traditional geographical area or the administrative divisions after the 1950s, they completely differ. Also, it is true that Chinese army in central area only acted within East China, so this book adopts the original Japanese one.

Second, chapters of this book were written in different periods, spanning more than a decade, so the translations of names are not the same, such as George. A. Fitch, translated earlier to Fitch, has been translated to Fei Wusheng according to the popular translation in recent years. In this book, it is marked with brackets in the index.

Third, the discussion in this book may appear repeatedly in other chapters, and it is retained due to the different emphasis of the issues discussed. However, there are two chapters on the same topic about Kogawa Seijiro, so one of them is omitted in this book.

Fourth, for the pejorative titles, quotation marks are generally used to show it is inappropriate (means “so-called”), without derogatory words added. Such as “Manchukuo”, it is not called “Puppet Manchukuo”, “Wang regime” is not called “Wang puppet regime”.

Fifth, for nouns that contain negative meaning, such as “fictional”, we do not add quotation marks, because fictional is not only commonly used in Japan, but also because it refers to the fact. And adding quotation mark is easy to misunderstand.

Sixth, some of the texts cited in this book are marked with special marks, such as “△, ○, □, ◎” and they remain original in this book, which are usually explained when they first appear.

CONTENTS

Monograph

Who Made Up the “Lies”—An Analysis on Japanese <i>Annual of the Japan Association for Nanjing Studies</i>	3
A Study of the Bearing and Discipline of the Japanese Army Invading China—Taking the 10th Army as an Example	39
Re-evaluation of Iwane Matsui’s War Guilt—Verifications of One of the Testimonies on the Nanjing Massacre Given by the Defendants at the Tokyo War Crimes Trials	81
A Study of the Massacre Order for Japanese Troops	115
Is the Nanjing Massacre a Fabrication Made by Tokyo Trial?	139
Is The Good Man of Nanking: The Diaries of John Rabe an “Unfounded Fabrication”?—An Examination of The Truth of Nanjing Incident: An Examination of <i>John Rabe’s Diaries</i>	193
Re-discussion on “The 100-Man Killing Contest”	225
Re-examination of Ogawa Sekijiro’s Testimony—Examination II of the Testimonies of the Defendants on Nanjing Atrocities in Tokyo Trial	239

Ogawa Sekijiro and Diary of a Military Legal Affairs Officer	267
The Study on Some Issues Concerning the Nanjing Massacre	273
An Introduction to Japan's Existing Historical Material on the Nanjing Massacre	297
Essays	
The "Legitimacy" That Cannot Be Self-justified	375
Impudently Take a Mistranslation as "Rebuttal Evidence"	381
How Can There Be "Not Expansion"	387
The Truth of "Substantial Concessions"	393
The Insincere "Peacefully Opening the City"	397
Three Questions on the Burial	405
Does Iwane Matsui Have Any Grievance to Tell?—An Analysis of OKADA Takashi's Arguments	413
Was What Fitch Said "Wrong"?	421
Questions on the Query Against Rabe	429
How Magee's Explanation Became Contradictory	433
Had the Population of the Safety Zone "Increased"?	437
There "Should Have Been No" Civilians Outside the Safety Zone	445
The Japanese Army's Sex Atrocities Cannot Be Denied Even If Victims Have Never Accused	449
Only Truth Has Power	455

Afterword	459
Appendix	463
References	531
Index	543